Cecilia's Mirror: the Role of the Pipe Organ

In the Catholic Church of the United States

In the Aftermath of Vatican II

by

Skye Hart

A Research Paper Presented in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Musical Arts

Approved November 2010 by the
Graduate Supervisory Committee:

Kimberly Marshall, Chair
Frank Koonce
Russell Ryan
Ted Solis

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

December 2010

ABSTRACT

The organ in the Catholic Church of the United States is a mirror of its time, reflecting the various challenges facing Catholic liturgy today. In some cases, it reflects the rich patrimony of European immigrants, anxious to replicate the liturgical conditions they left behind. In others, it reflects the efforts of liturgical reformers to "update" the liturgy, creating more opportunities for what they understand to be active participation of the faithful. The absence of the organ in some American Catholic churches, particularly, in the time following the liturgical reforms of Vatican II, raises questions on the direction of sacred music in these churches as well as the survival and viability of the organ as the principal musical instrument of the Catholic liturgy.

In all, the organ in American Catholic churches serves as a gauge of the current liturgical climate, and, in a broader sense, the direction and viability of the Catholic Church in America. In this paper, I argue that the survival of the organ in American Catholic churches depends largely on the number of Catholics who continue to remain active in the Church, as well as their views on liturgy, and their musical formation. While recent figures indicate a gradual decline in membership in the Catholic Church among younger generations, interest in organ and traditional Catholic sacred music by some Catholics may ensure the organ's continued presence. The extent to which some groups implement liturgical directives of Pope Benedict XVI, and the activities of groups that support traditional Roman Catholic liturgy, play a role in the organ's continued survival. Also crucial are those who support the organ for its own artistic and musical

merit, including contemporary composers of liturgical organ music, organ students in Catholic higher education programs, and organ builders. As opposed to total extinction, the use of the organ in American Catholic churches may take on a new shape, surrounded by a church that struggles to reconcile modern culture with the transcendent.

DEDICATION

To all my teachers who introduced me to the beauties of organ playing.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I wish to thank my advisor, Kimberly Marshall, for all the growth, musical and personal, I have experienced during these fruitful years of study at Arizona State University, and for the many opportunities she has given me to pursue my musical interests. I also wish to thank Arizona State School of Music Professors Frank Koonce, Russell Ryan, and Ted Solis for agreeing to be on my doctoral committee and sharing their expertise and assistance. I must also acknowledge the enthusiastic support of my pastor, Father Douglass Lorig, all the staff and parishioners of St. Maria Goretti Catholic Church in Scottsdale, Arizona, and all of the clergy and parishes I have worked with in the past, who inspired me in my love for the organ and liturgical music, and encouraged my desire to share my love of this music with others.

I am truly grateful to so many others for their continual support; my parents, Sean and Kathleen, who encouraged me in my love for the pipe organ, spending countless hours driving me to lessons and attending concerts, exposing me to glorious music at a vast array of churches and music venues; my sister, Kaitlin, for her day-to-day presence amid the joys and challenges of life; my youngest sister, Delrose, whose budding musical talent is an immediate promise of hope for the future; all my former teachers, especially, Russell Stinson, Joel Plaag, Stephen Shebenik, and Catherine Bordeau, who set the standard for teaching excellence, scholarship, and generosity, to which I can only aspire; and, finally, all of my friends and colleagues, in the School of Music and elsewhere. There is not enough room to name everyone individually, but I must thank, in

particular, Dr. Anny Cheng, Kristin Holton Prouty and Jorge Perez for their feedback and encouragement. Little by little, we are all doing what we can to make the world a more beautiful place.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER Page

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

The pipe organ, along with Gregorian chant and polyphony, is to be accorded "high esteem" in the Roman Catholic liturgy, according to the Church's current liturgical documents, including the writings of the Second Vatican Council.[1] Liturgical documents of the twentieth-century, including Pope Pius X's *moto proprio Tra Le Sollecitudini,* the Second Vatican Council's *Constitutions on the Sacred Liturgy*, and the post-Conciliar *Musicam Sacram*, reaffirm the Catholic Church's long-lived affinity for the organ and its role in Catholic worship as "the traditional musical instrument" of the Church.[2] The presence of pipe organs in Catholic churches and monasteries from the Middle Ages, along with liturgical organ compositions dating back to the fourteenth century, attest to the strong association between the organ and Catholic liturgy. This tradition, a distinctive feature of European Christianity, spread to United States as Europeans immigrated to the New World. Catholics were among the first immigrants to the United States, first from Spain, and later, from France. A new wave of Catholic immigrants appeared during the nineteenth and twentieth-centuries, eventually numbering Catholics as the single largest Christian denomination in the country.[3]

---

[1]The Missionary Society of Saint Paul the Apostle in the State of New York. *The Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy of the Second Vatican Council and the Motu Proprio of Pope Paul VI.* (Glen Rock, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1964), 69.

[2] The Missionary Society of Saint Paul, *The Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy,* 69.

[3] The National Council of Churches, "Catholics, Mormons, Assemblies of God growing; Mainline churches report a continuing decline" from National Council of Churches' Website, http://www.ncccusa.org/news/100204yearbook2010.html (Accessed 4 September 2010).

Just as the number of Catholics multiplied in the United States, so also did their churches, seminaries, convents, monasteries and educational institutions. As emerging immigrant communities sought to recreate the culture they left behind, they built on the European musical traditions that were familiar to them. Among these traditions was the use of the pipe organ in Catholic churches, thus many organs were installed and used to accompany the Mass and liturgical functions. As the Catholic community established itself in the United States, simultaneously, a number of movements emerged within the Catholic Church seeking a return to what they considered to be "authentic" liturgy, and a removal of liturgical accretions that manifested themselves in the liturgy during the eighteenth and nineteenth-centuries. Musically, a growing emphasis was placed on music of a "sacred" style, with Gregorian chant and Renaissance polyphony held as the epitome of liturgical music. The pipe organ, according to Pope Pius X's motu proprio was the only musical instrument permitted during liturgies, and music was to be of a decidedly sacred nature, worthy of the liturgy's solemn and dignified nature.

In something of a twist of fate, the proponents of liturgical reform opened the way for the more drastic reforms and experiments that took place later in the years during and after the Second Vatican Council (1961-1965), changes that were sometimes novel, with little or no basis in the liturgical practices of the past. Meanwhile, the Catholics who were once poor, uneducated immigrants, were becoming more acculturated, and consequently, more open to leaving past cultural practices behind. As the concept of "active participation" grew among the laity,

many of the challenges came from the musical sector, where Catholics, who were used to "hearing" the Mass, were now expected to "participate" in it. The need for congregational singing, along with the appearance of folk and popular musical idioms, posed challenges for organists in Catholic churches across the United States. Some, anxious to appear "up-to-date," abandoned the organ as a trapping of a bygone era. Others found ways to incorporate it into the reformed liturgy. In all, the organ has been in a state of constant flux since the 1960's.

This brings us to the present day, and ultimately, the purpose of this paper. After reflecting on the tumultuous climate in which the organ continues to survive in Catholic churches, we must ask ourselves "Where is the organ today?" Where are new instruments being installed in Catholic institutions and what types of pipe organs are being installed? Also, which are the primary Catholic educational institutions that teach the organ, particularly in the context of liturgical music-making, and what is their level of success? My *modus operandi* is that, through surveying the past and present situation in the United States, we may have some idea of how to answer the question: "What is the future of the pipe organ in Catholic churches and institutions in the United States?" Undoubtedly, the organ, for the Catholic Church, requires the liturgy for its survival. In some parishes, the organ's status is threatened by an aging, and perhaps, disappearing congregation. In others, where congregations continue to thrive, the situation depends much on the nature of the people who attend. Conservative or traditionalist Catholics who desire a return to a more solemn liturgical style after the traditional European manner exist alongside Catholics who are more influenced by contemporary

evangelical worship. Another point to consider is that the largest and most quickly-growing group of Catholics is immigrants, primarily from Latin America. Perhaps, even more important than these subdivisions, is the future of the American Catholic church in the face of modern issues, including a decreasing interest in organized religion among younger generations. Can the organ survive in Catholic churches if there is no congregation to support it? All of these questions are worth considering, especially for those who value the organ in American Catholic worship and desire its continued presence for years to come.

CHAPTER 2

THE LITURGICAL MOVEMENT AND ITS IMPACT ON THE ORGAN

The Birth of the Liturgical Movement and the Reforms of Pius X

The myriad changes in the Roman Catholic liturgy and its music that took place in the years during and following the Second Vatican Council, while seemingly coming from out of nowhere, were in many ways the culmination of work that began in earnest in mid-nineteenth-century France. Following the chaos of the French Revolution, French Catholic clergy saw the need to re-establish the country's liturgical life and reform liturgical books, which at the time were in a state of disorder.[4] One of the most significant figures in this movement of liturgical renewal was a parish priest from Le Mans, Dom Proper Guéranger, who began a campaign to reopen the ancient Abbey of Solesmes, which had been abandoned during the Revolution. Guéranger felt it was necessary, as Keith Pecklers states, to "minister to the needs of the contemporary Church and the world, while always remaining faithful to the monastic rule and teaching of the Church."[5] Guéranger wrote two important series of books on the liturgy, *L'Année Liturgique* and *Institutions Liturgiques*. These works, some of the earliest attempts at making the Church's liturgy and customs understandable for clergy and laity, were influential throughout the Catholic world, and helped give birth to

[4] Keith F. Pecklers, *The Unread Vision: the Liturgical Movement in the United States of America* (Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1998), 2.

[5] Pecklers, *The Unread Vision,* 3.

what became known as the "Liturgical Movement," even influencing the liturgical reforms enacted later by Pope Pius X.[6]

The monks of Solesmes took on an even more arduous task than writing on the liturgical year, in assembling the books used for singing the liturgy in Gregorian chant. At the time they began their research and editing process, the use of Gregorian chant in the Mass and the Offices had practically disappeared in many churches in favor of music inspired by the secular idioms that were in vogue at that time. Thus, it was more common to encounter a High Mass with music provided by an orchestra and operatic soloists that it was to find a High Mass sung with the appointed Gregorian chant propers and commons.[7] The monks of Solesmes sought to restore Gregorian chant to its rightful place of importance and provide, according to their criteria, a more authentic way of singing the chants. By reviewing hundreds of medieval chant manuscripts, the monks were able to conclude which versions of a given chant were the oldest and most complete, and thus the most authentic text. These chants were then transcribed into modern chant notation and compiled into books organized according to their usage and where they fall within the Liturgical Year, such as the *Liber Usualis*.[8] Pope Pius X would later hold the Solesmes editions as the

[6] Pecklers, *The Unread Vision,* 3.

[7] Pecklers, The *Unread Vision,* 256.

[8] Pecklers, The *Unread Vision,* 256.

standard for Gregorian chant, giving them the exclusive designation as the Vatican's official publisher of liturgical chant texts in 1904.[9]

The Liturgical Movement Travels to the United States

In the United States, the *Liturgical Movement* was disseminated at first by the Benedictine monks of St. John's Abbey in Collegeville, Minnesota, who, having been exposed to it in Europe, brought it back with them to the United States.[10] The Liturgical Movement emphasized the importance of all the Church's members, including the laity, as equal participants in the Church's liturgical life, which, in turn, required "full and active" participation in the liturgy.[11] Keith Pecklers notes that the condition of Catholic liturgical life in the United States varied according to where the immigrants originated. Irish Catholic immigrants, he argues, were accustomed to impoverished liturgical conditions, having been "stripped of their liturgical and musical traditions" by Protestant English persecutors in the Penal days, when Catholic worship was outlawed, forcing them to celebrate the Mass in secret.[12] Some Irish Catholics viewed hymn singing at Mass as a Protestant development and preferred to worship without music even though there were no such restrictions placed on their worship once they arrived in the United States. Other groups, such as German Catholic immigrants, brought

[9] Pierre Comb, *The Restoration of Gregorian Chant: Solesmes and the Vatican Edition* (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press, 2003), 240-241.

[10] Pecklers, The *Unread Vision,* 18-19.

[11] Pecklers, The *Unread Vision,* 25.

[12] Pecklers, The *Unread Vision,* 36.

with them a more strongly established tradition of congregational singing and participation, thus rendering them more receptive to the propositions of the Liturgical Movement.[13] Other liturgical scholars, like Father Frank Quinn, O.P., suggest that one of the reasons Catholic congregational singing was stunted was because hymnody, by its very nature, requires the ability to read and the money and materials needed to publish music books.[14] Poor Catholic immigrants often lacked both of these. Quinn also adds that when Catholic congregations did sing, it was often during non-liturgical devotional services, such as a novena service to particular saints or the Benediction of the Blessed Sacrament, and not during the Mass itself. Consequently, many Catholics were not accustomed to singing during the Mass; this also explains why so many of the devotional hymns focused more on a particular saint rather than on the liturgical propers of a given day.[15]

The Cecilian Movement and its Influence on Catholic Music Prior to Vatican II

As the nineteenth-century Liturgical Movement responded to a growing desire of informed clergy and laity to foster the essential, communal nature of the liturgy, a new musical current within the Catholic Church was also developing, the Cecilian Movement. The movement was born through the combination of several early efforts at liturgical musical reform in the early nineteenth-century,

[13] Pecklers, The *Unread Vision*, 36-37.

[14] Frank C. Quinn, O.P., "Problems of Hymnody in Catholic Worship," *Liturgy and Music: Lifetime Learning, Leaver*, A. Robin and Joyce Ann Zimmerman, eds. (Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press, 1998), 311.

[15] Frank C. Quinn, "Problems of Hymnody in Catholic Worship," 312.

eventually making its way to the United States around 1838.[16] The primary aim of the Cecilian Movement was to make church musicians knowledgeable of the Church's laws on sacred music. It also provided examples of music that was considered acceptable for Catholic liturgy and music that was to be avoided. While the Cecilian societies generally discouraged vernacular hymnody in the liturgy, they should be credited, according to Rev. Anthony Ruff, O.S.B., for dramatically altering "the state of music in churches of all sizes" in an effort to renew Catholic liturgical life.[17]

One of the primary characteristics of the Cecilian movement was its idealization of music from the past, from Gregorian chant to the polyphony of Palestrina to the cantatas of Johann Sebastian Bach, as examples of music that was "truly sacred" by virtue of its age and lack of association with popular music.[18] Although some argue that the music that came out of this movement sometimes exhibits a "slavish" imitation of Palestrina's *a capella* style, the movement did help to curtail music of questionable appropriateness, such as the practice of singing secular opera choruses substituted with the common text of the Mass.[19] Some well-known Austro-German composers, including Anton Bruckner, who were aware of Cecilian musical norms, maintained that composers should not

---

[16] Edward E. Schaefer, *Catholic Music Through the Ages: Balancing the Needs of a Worshipping Church* (Chicago: Hillenbrand Books, 2008), 111.

[17] Anthony Ruff, OSB, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform: Treasures and Transformations*. (Chicago: Hillenbrand Books, 2007), 45.

[18] Schaefer. *Catholic Music Through the Ages,* 113.

[19] Schaefer. *Catholic Music Through the Ages,* 112, 114.

be constrained when writing music for the liturgy.[20] Other composers, like Josef Rheinberger, were more sympathetic to the Cecilian ideal. Rheinberger himself was an important figure in the early days of the Cecilian Society in Regensburg, Bavaria, in Germany.[21] Rheinberger wrote numerous works for liturgical use, including Masses which often found their inspiration in Renaissance polyphony, and twenty-four organ sonatas, written in every key just as Johann Sebastian Bach had done with his *Well-Tempered Clavier*.[22] Joel Scraper asserts that even Franz Liszt, who later in life received minor clerical orders in the Catholic Church, was influenced by ideals of the Cecilian Movement, with extensive Palestrina-style *a capella* writing in his sacred works, such as *Christus.*[23] Despite Liszt's apparent admiration for certain older styles of music, he opposed the Caecilians' prohibition on orchestral music during the Mass, dismissing the Cecilians as being narrow-minded.[24] Thus, while the Cecilian movement gained influence within the Church, some musicians and composers resisted the movement, fearing a strict return to Gregorian chant and Latin polyphony would hinder their creativity.[25]

---

[20] Schaffer, *Catholic Music Through the Ages,* 114.

[21] Joel F Scraper, "Josef Gabriel Rheinberger and the Regensburg Cecilian movement" (DMA Diss., University of Missouri-Kansas City, 2006), 34.

[22] Scraper, "Josef Gabriel Rheinberger and the Regensburg Cecilian movement," 34.

[23] Scraper, "Josef Gabriel Rheinberger and the Regensburg Cecilian movement," 20.

[24] Edward Foley and Mark Paul Bangert, *Worship Music: A Concise Dictionary* (Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 2000), 58.

[25] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 248-249.

In the United States, the idea of liturgical musical reform was due in part to John (Johann) Singenberger, a Swiss Catholic composer, who founded the first American chapter of Society of St. Cecilia in Milwaukee in 1874.[26] Many dioceses subsequently founded their own societies for sacred music renewal. Some even issued "black" lists of music that was deemed inappropriate and to be avoided and "white" lists of music that was appropriate and encouraged.[27] Despite these gains, the Cecilian Movement in the United States, like its European counterpart, was not accepted by everyone, including some Catholic parishioners who found Latin plainchant to be boring in comparison to the more emotional, operatic style of music they had become accustomed to hearing in church.[28]

The Liturgical Musical Reforms of Popes Pius X and Pius XI

In an act that would please proponents of the Cecilian and Liturgical Movements while displeasing others who were not on board with these ideals, Pope Pius X published a *motu proprio* – a personal document made on a pope's own initiative without the help of others – entitled *Tra Le Sollecitudini* in 1903.[29] The document reflected the pope's life-long interest in sacred music, especially Gregorian chant, which he wished to restore "to the use of the people."[30] One of

[26] Pecklers, The *Unread Vision*, 267.

[27] Pecklers, The *Unread Vision*, 257.

[28] Pecklers, The *Unread Vision*, 257.

[29] Charles Hebermann et al., eds. *The Catholic Encyclopedia: An International Work of Reference on the Constitution, Doctrine, Discipline, and History of the Catholic Church* (New York: The Encyclopedia Press, 1913), 10:602.

[30] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 210.

the most innovative aspects of the document was the pope's call for "active participation" in the liturgy by all people, not just clergy and consecrated religious.[31] Another important effect of the document on Catholic music was to create greater uniformity of liturgical practice among worshipers. This was aided, in part, through the increased centralization of papal authority following the decree of papal infallibility of the First Vatican Council (1869-1870), which declared that the pope's official teachings regarding faith and morals were always correct and free from error.[32]

Pope Pius X developed an interest in sacred music long before he was elected to the papacy. As a seminarian in Padua, Italy, Pius X learned Gregorian chant, and was so taken with it that he made its "restoration" in the liturgy one of his primary missions in life.[33] As Cardinal-Patriarch of Venice, Pius issued a pastoral letter to his clergy on church music reform. Remarking on it to a group of listeners he noted, "I know…it will go against the wishes of many of the faithful – and no doubt of the clergy too.[34] The letter, sent in 1895, explained in an unambiguous tone that church music was intended to help people pray, holding Gregorian chant and the polyphony of Palestrina as musical ideals.[35] Conversely, he also expressed a desire to see instruments like drums, bells, and trumpets

---

[31] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 210-211.

[32] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 273.

[33] Katherine Burton, *The Great Mantle: The Life of Giuseppe Melchiore Sarto Pope Pius X* (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1950), 18.

[34] Burton, *The Great Mantle,* 112.

[35] Burton, *The Great Mantle,* 113.

disappear from liturgical music, and, as an added incentive, that Masses sung with Gregorian chant would be shorter, preventing the faithful in attendance from growing weary.[36] Pius also noted his pleasure at visiting a parish where the parishioners sang the common parts of the Mass as well as the psalms and hymns at Vespers. Even before his ascent to the papacy, Pius X's fondness of lay participation in the liturgy was evident.[37]

Just a few months after his election to the papacy in 1903, Pius X continued his work for sacred music reform, this time as leader of the entire Catholic Church. Prior to the release of *Tra Le Sollecitudini*, the pope began work on reforming the Breviary and the Psalter, restoring the proper observance of the liturgical seasons, which were often eclipsed by the observance of various saints' feast days, and reorganizing the Psalter so that all the psalms could be chanted in their entirety during the course of a week.[38] By November 22, 1903, the Feast of Saint Cecilia, patron saint of music, Pius X issued his *motu proprio* on sacred music. Its demands were strict, including the prohibition on use of bands and orchestras during Mass, as well as a prohibition on hiring paid singers.[39] Regarding modern music, the Pope cautiously permitted it, with careful stipulations:

---

[36] Burton, *The Great Mantle,* 113.

[37] Burton, *The Great Mantle,* 113.

[38] Burton, *The Great Mantle,* 168-169.

[39] Burton, *The Great Mantle,* 170.

> Among the different kinds of modern music, that which appears less suitable for accompanying the functions of public worship is the theatrical style, which was in the greatest vogue, especially in Italy, during the last century. This of its very nature is diametrically opposed to Gregorian Chant and classic polyphony, and therefore to the most important law of all good sacred music. Besides the intrinsic structure, the rhythm and what is known as the conventionalism of this style adapt themselves but badly to the requirements of true liturgical music.[40]

For organists, *Tra Le Sollecitudini* was significant in that it simultaneously affirmed the organ's place in Catholic worship while also limiting its use. According to the document, the organ was subordinate to the voice, adding that it must share in the "qualities that sacred music possesses," ostensibly a call to refrain from organ music associated with a "secular" style.[41] Unlike later documents, such as the Second Vatican Council's *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* or *Musicam Sacram*, which praise the use of the organ, *Tra Le Sollecitudini* employs sparser language, stating that the organ is permitted, but does not add that the instrument is necessarily prized in the liturgy:

> Although the music proper to the Church is purely vocal music, music with the accompaniment of the organ is also permitted. In some special cases, within due limits and with proper safeguards, other instruments may be allowed, but never without the special permission of the Ordinary, according to prescriptions of the Caeremoniale Episcoporum. As the singing should always have the principal place, the organ or other instruments should merely sustain and never oppress it.[42]

---

[40] Pope Pius X, "Moto Proprio---Tra Le Sollecitudini (Sections II, III, IV)," *Sacred Music* 131, no. 1 (Spring 2004): 8.

[41] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 280-281.

[42] Pope Pius X, "Moto Proprio---Tra Le Sollecitudini (Sections V-IX)," *Sacred Music* 131, no. 2 (Summer 2004): 8.

While the organ is "permitted," the pope's main concern seems to be that the organ not "oppress" vocal music. Other instruments were permitted, with reluctance, to play with the organ, provided they were similar in tone to the organ. Woodwinds, according to this logic, could be used but band instruments could not.[43] The pope also add that "the employment of the piano is forbidden in church, as is also that of noisy or frivolous instruments such as drums, cymbals, bells and the like."[44]

In 1928, twenty-five years following Pius X's *motu proprio,* Pope Pius XI issued an apostolic constitution on sacred music, *Divini Cultis Sanctitatem*, which reaffirmed much of Pius X's reforms while allowing more freedom in some areas, including organ music. Pius XI took a more permissive view of the organ in liturgy than his predecessor, writing:

> There is one musical instrument, however, which properly and by tradition belongs to the Church, and that is the organ. On account of its grandeur and majesty it has always been considered worthy to mingle with liturgical rites.[45]

In addition to acknowledging the Church's organ tradition, he goes on to speak of the organ's role in accompanying liturgical singing, or "when the choir is silent, to play, as prescribed, sweet harmonies."[46] Pius encouraged new compositions of

---

[43] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 281.

[44] Pius X, "Moto Proprio---Tra Le Sollecitudini (Sections V-IX)," 8.

[45] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 288. Quoting *Divini Cultis Sanctitatem,* section 8.

[46] Pope Pius XI, "Divini Cultis Sanctitatem," Official Website of the Vatican. http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/pius_xi/apost_constitutions/documents/hf_p-xi_apc_19281220_divini-cultus-sanctitatem_lt.html (Accessed 9 September 2010). Translation my own. In the original Latin: Est quidem Ecclesiae proprium musicum instrumentum a maioribus

organ music, provided they were not contaminated by "new-fangled musical styles" of profane music.[47] Thus, while Pius XI's view on the organ was more liberal than Pius X, he was, nonetheless, cautious when it came to musical composition. His preference for "sweet harmonies" also seems to indicate the pontiff's predilection for tonal music, though he offers no precise definition as to what qualifies as "sweet," highlighting some of the difficulties of understanding documents on church music written by prelates with a limited musical comprehension.

Liturgical Music in American Catholic churches prior to Vatican II

Even prior to the arrival of the Liturgical Movement in the United States, American Catholics established a precedent for being revolutionaries in more than one sense of the word. In 1634 the colony of Maryland – named after the English Catholic queen – was established as a "refuge" for English Catholics, but by 1704 English authorities had banned public observance of Catholicism, save for services held in the privacy of one's home.[48] Later, with the severing of ties between the American colonies and Great Britain, Catholics in Colonial America were free from the severe restrictions that had been imposed on them under

---

traditum, organum, ut aiunt; quod, ob miram quandam granditatem maiestatemque, dignum habitum est ut cum liturgicis ritibus coniungeretur, sive cantum comitando, sive, silente choro, ad praescripta, harmonias suavissimas eliciendo.

[47] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 288. Quoting "Divini Cultis Sanctitatem," section 8.

[48] Robert R. Grimes, "John Aitken and Catholic Music in Federal Philadelphia," *American Music*. Vol. 16, No. 3 (Autumn, 1998), 289.

British rule.[49] During the early part of the Eighteenth-century, many Catholics relocated to Pennsylvania where the Quaker population treated them with greater tolerance than the British, and by 1734 Catholics opened their first public chapel in Philadelphia, replete with decorations and a pipe organ.[50]

Remarkably, period accounts of Catholic services during this time point to an already-established practice of congregational singing with organ accompaniment. In 1774, John Adams visited then Saint Mary's Church in Philadelphia out of curiosity, describing it as "most aweful and affecting." The music, consisting of "an organ and choir of singers, went all afternoon except sermon time. And the assembly chanted most sweetly and exquisitely."[51] Other accounts, such as those by Francis Hopkinson, friend of Benjamin Franklin, insinuate that the musical life of Colonial Philadelphia found its apex in the city's Catholic parish. Hopkinson writes about Saint Mary's organist, Stephan Forrage "except for For[r]age and myself I don't know a single votary the Goddess [Music] hath in this large city."[52] Several years later, in 1789, Father John Carroll was appointed by Rome and the first Bishop of the American Colonies, establishing his cathedral in Baltimore. Carroll, who was trained in liturgical music by French Jesuits at Saint-Omers, Flanders, exercised great influence over colonial Catholic music. With the help of friend and English composer Samuel

[49] Grimes, "John Aitken and Catholic Music in Federal Philadelphia," 290.

[50] Grimes, "John Aitken and Catholic Music in Federal Philadelphia," 290.

[51] Grimes, "John Aitken and Catholic Music in Federal Philadelphia," 290.

[52] Grimes. "John Aitken and Catholic Music in Federal Philadelphia," 291

Webbe, he ordered an organ from England for the new Catholic cathedral, specifying that it be "six stops—vox humana and flute—to be sent by fall ships to Baltimore…"[53] Jesuit priest and musicologist Father Robert Grimes believes that Carroll also had a hand in the assembly of one of the earliest books containing service music for early-American Catholics, the *Compilation* of 1787. Grimes describes the book's contents, which include a surprising amount of liturgical music for the Catholic layperson:

> The first edition contains a fair assortment of service music with liturgical texts, such as the Ordinary of the Mass, the psalms for Sunday vespers, the Gregorian Requiem Mass, the four Marian Antiphons for Compline (which were generally sung in America at the end of the Vespers service), the "Veni Creator Spiritus" and six settings of the "Litany of Loretto." The last two titles were among the most frequently sung pieces in early American Catholicism. The "Veni Creator Spiritus" was regularly sung by the congregation before a sermon was delivered, before Sunday school classes, and on numerous other occasions.[54]

This collection displays two rather unusual characteristics of early-American Catholicism that would later become the norm by the 1960's; first, the encouragement for congregational participation in liturgical services; and second, the appearance of actions not prescribed in the Missal – the book containing the ritual of the Mass – for the sake of congregational participation, such as the singing of the "Veni Creator Spiritus" before a sermon, as Grimes mentions.

To be certain, American Catholics faced many difficulties regarding the level and quality of music used liturgically long before the reforms following Vatican II. Accounts from the California Catholic missions from the late-

[53] Grimes. "John Aitken and Catholic Music in Federal Philadelphia," 293.

[54] Grimes. "John Aitken and Catholic Music in Federal Philadelphia," 294.

eighteenth to the early-nineteenth centuries report a number of peculiar musical customs that had arisen. Mission Santa Clara, which boasted a small organ imported from France and an orchestra of forty-some musicians, was said to perform secular music throughout the Mass, including waltzes and polkas.[55] When the French explorer De Mofras attended Mass at the mission, he noted his amazement at hearing "La Marseillaise" played during the Elevation and "Vive Henri Quatre" during the procession.[56] Later, in the middle of the twentieth-century, the liturgical music in some places had only marginally improved. Shortly before the Second Vatican Council, Paul Hume, music editor for the Washington Post from 1946-1982 and a convert to Catholicism, complained about the state of Catholic liturgical music in 1957: "For to say, as I do unequivocally, that most of the hymns most frequently sung in Catholic parishes are execrably bad music and therefore entirely unfit for use in the church is to raise the hackles of a large percentage of the Catholic population."[57] And while the organ was almost exclusively the only instrument used in Catholic churches prior to the liturgical reforms of the 1960's, its use was often far from exemplary, due to a combination of poor-quality liturgical music compositions and a lack of trained organists to play the instrument.

---

[55] Ochse, Orpha Caroline. *The History of the Organ in the United States* (Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1988), 8.

[56] Ochse, *The History of the Organ in the United States,* 8.

[57] Paul Hume. *Catholic Church Music* (New York: Dodd, Mean and Co., 1957), 76.

A prime example of standard organ repertoire in U.S. Catholic churches prior to Vatican II is Father Carlo Rossini's *The Liturgical Organist,* a seven-volume collection of short pieces that could be played at various parts of the Mass. Rossini, who served as organist and choirmaster at St. Paul's Cathedral in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, from 1926-1949, attempted to make higher-quality liturgical music accessible to parishes with average to less-than-average resources.[58] Rossini's view of the organ's role in liturgy is rather specific, if not somewhat narrow, stating:

> The organ in church is not an end to itself but only a means; in other words, the organ has been admitted in church not to rule, not to furnish entertainment or to attract the attention of the congregation upon the virtuosity of the organist, but only and exclusively to clothe with suitable harmonies the liturgical singing and to comment by inspiring melodies upon the various of the liturgical action, so that the faithful may be the more easily moved to piety, devotion, recollection and meditation.[59]

Rossini's conception of the organ as primarily an accompanimental instrument that provides occasional "traveling music," reflects an ideal prevalent in Catholic churches in the U.S. during the era immediately preceding Vatican II, beginning with Pius X's heavy stipulations on the use of the organ. This subdued treatment of the organ, though well-intentioned, placed limitations on organists, and, possibly, prevented them from using the organ to its full potential and from sharing masterful compositions with the wider church audience. Nonetheless, Rossini's collection of short works by himself and other lesser-known composers

---

[58] Schaefer, *Catholic Music Through the Ages,* 126-127.

[59] Carlo Rossini, ed. *The Liturgical Organist, Volume 1: Easy Compositions -- Preludes, Interludes & Postludes for Pipe or Reed Organ* (New York: J. Fischer & Bro., 1937), v.

from the eighteenth and nineteenth-centuries, while, not numbered among the organ's masterworks by professional organists today, represents an effort to provide dignified music for the liturgy that was not drawn from popular music or secular opera repertoire.[60] In his preface to *The Liturgical Organist*, Rossini defends the simplicity of the pieces in the collection against those who find them musically deficient:

> As for the organist of superior ability who may be tempted to disregard these simple forms of liturgical art, it is hardly necessary to remind him: that church music is not for art's sake, but art put to the service of a higher purpose—consequently, it is not a matter of what we "prefer to play" in church, but "what is appropriate;" 2) that simple music may be "good music"…hence it is not at all essential that church music be grand, complex, or superlatively artistic… 3) that the ordinary congregation is not an assembly of musicians but it consists mainly of earnest, simple people whose intellect and emotion may be reached only through simple forms of art.[61]

Rossini's characterization of the average parishioner as "simple" and, therefore, incapable of comprehending great musical works, reflects a common attitude among Catholic musicians of his day.

Some reports paint a rather unflattering picture of the caliber of organists normally employed in Catholic churches, especially in the average American parish. Sister Theophane Hytrek, a member of the School Sisters of St. Francis and a prominent figure in the U.S. liturgical music scene both before and after the Second Vatican Council, published a 1967 essay, "Facing Reality in the Liturgical Music Apostolate." As one all too familiar with the standard practice in most

---

[60] Schaefer. *Catholic Music Through the Ages,* 126-127.

[61] Rossini, *The Liturgical Organist,* v.

parishes in America, Hytrek writes that parishioners "deserve effective leadership in music," and she bemoans church leaders who expect "any grade-school child or dear old lady who has had a few piano lessons" to lead the parish with all the competency needed as an organist.[62] This apparent shortage of good organists, or at least, clergy willing to spend the money to employ them, is almost certainly another decisive factor in the pipe organ's disappearance from some Catholic churches in the years following Vatican II. Aware of many clergy member's preference to cut costs when it came to music, Hytrek cautions: "this is not to say that children or adult amateurs cannot learn to play the organ in an acceptable manner. The point to be made is just this: the availability of amateurs who serve without a fee should not be the sole criterion for pastors who are seeking the services of an organist."[63]

For the present-day church organist, Hytrek's remarks remind us that the issue of Catholic clergy attempting to reduce costs at the expense of musical quality is nothing new. Sister Hytrek also reinforces one of the main causes of the Vatican II reforms, to elevate the standard of all liturgical elements, including music, to their utmost potential. With the advent of the Second Vatican Council, the Church, issued important documents, encouraging a higher level of excellence in liturgical music, while maintaining the Church's long musical tradition. At the

---

[62] Theophane Hytrek, OSF, "Facing Reality in the Liturgical Music Apostolate," *Crisis in Church Music*. Liturgical Conference of America, ed. (Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967), 100.

[63] Hytrek, "Facing Reality in the Liturgical Music Apostolate," 100.

same time, conflicts and ambiguities within these documents, as well as differing opinions as to what constitutes excellent liturgical music, paved the way for wide discrepancies in the nature of sacred music reforms and how they should be implemented. For organists, the Second Vatican Council presents special challenges, as the instrument's purpose changes with the increasingly active nature of the liturgy.

CHAPTER 3

"HIGH ESTEEM:" THE SECOND VATICAN COUNCIL AND THE ORGAN

Pope John XXIII, the Second Vatican Council Documents, and the Pipe Organ

Just as Western society underwent great changes in the years following the Second World War, the Catholic Church felt increasing pressure to respond to the needs of changing times. There were also the various calls for liturgical reform which had begun with the Liturgical Movement in the nineteenth-century which had only grown stronger by the late 1950's. On May 17, 1959, shortly after his election to the papacy in 1958, Pope John XXIII announced that an ecumenical council would be called to strengthen the faith of Catholics worldwide while adapting to the needs of the times.[64] This came as a great surprise to many Catholics, who had expected the older, pleasant "good Pope John" to be "transitional" pope rather than one who would call an ecumenical council that would have lasting effects on Catholicism.[65]

In 1962, the first session met and immediately dealt with issues of liturgical reform, including the role of music in the liturgy. Perhaps the most persistent theme throughout the entire session was the call for all Catholics, laity included, to be "active participants" in the liturgy. One way this was accommodated was through the introduction of vernacular language in the liturgy. The *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* states that the rites should be celebrated in

---

[64] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 315.

[65] Peter Hebblethwaite, *Pope John XXIII: Shepherd of the Modern World* (Garden City, New York: Doubleday & Company, Inc., 1985), 306.

song, but does not expressly state that the liturgy must be in Latin.[66] Nonetheless, the documents stress sacred music's role as one that lends "greater solemnity" to the liturgical rites.[67]

In contrast to many Catholic parishes that more or less abandoned the organ in the years following the Council, the *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* praises the pipe organ, stating that it is "to be held in high esteem" as the "traditional instrument that adds splendor to ecclesial ceremonies and raises hearts to God."[68] While the *Constitution* allows for other instruments, in contrast to the earlier restrictions of *Tra Le Sollecitudini*, it hastens to add that the instruments must be "suitable" for sacred use, and "are in accord with the dignity of the place of worship, and truly contribute to the uplifting of the faithful."[69] Of course, room is left for interpretation as to what defines a "suitable" instrument; the *Constitution* only gives us a general idea. Additionally, Anthony Ruff notes that the Council Fathers were careful to add the word "pipe" to differentiate the pipe organ from electronic organs.[70] This designation, while seemingly minor, is in keeping with the idea that all art used in the liturgy be "genuine."[71]

---

[66] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 318.

[67] David Lysik, ed, *The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource* (Chicago: Liturgy Training Publications, 1991), 30.

[68] Lysik, *The Liturgy Documents,* 31.

[69] Lysik, *The Liturgy Documents,* 31.

[70] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 324.

[71] Lysik, *The Liturgy Documents,* 30.

"Musicam Sacram" and the Pipe Organ

In an effort to clarify and expand the Council's instructions on sacred music in the *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy*, the Vatican's Sacred Congregation of Rites issued the instruction *Musicam Sacram* on March 5, 1967 as a "continuation and complement of the preceding Instruction of this Sacred Congregation."[72] Like the earlier Council documents, *Musicam Sacram* emphasizes the role of all people in the liturgy, adding "One cannot find anything more religious and more joyful in sacred celebrations than a whole congregation expressing its faith and devotion in song."[73] The document lists a number of places in the Mass where the faithful should participate in song, stressing the importance of the *Missa in Cantu*, or, "sung Mass," adding that it be celebrated on all Sundays and principal feasts, even multiple times in one day.[74] In a departure from previous documents, *Musicam Sacram* calls into question the feasibility of polyphonic Mass parts, which are problematic due to the Council's call for the common parts of the Mass to be sung congregationally whenever possible.[75] Although new vernacular settings of the Mass ordinary were to be set, other classical settings, such as those by Tallis or Byrd, could be used, even if their

[72] The Sacred Congregation of Rites, "Musicam Sacram," *Vatican Council II: The Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents,* Austin Flannery, OP, ed. (Northport, New York: Costello Publishing Company, 1975), 80.

[73] The Sacred Congregation of Rites, "Musicam Sacram," 84.

[74] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 344.

[75] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 345.

texts differ slightly from the new approved texts.[76] And while in some instances choirs could still perform polyphonic works in place of the "people's song," especially in cases where the faithful were not "sufficiently instructed" in singing, the singing of the entire Proper or Ordinary parts of the Mass was to be "deprecated," with preference given to congregational singing over choral singing.[77]

While the document's instructions regarding congregational singing of the Mass posed new challenges, especially to the continuation of the polyphonic Mass tradition, *Musicam Sacram* affirmed the importance of the organ in the liturgy:

> The pipe organ is to be held in high esteem in the Latin Church, since it is its traditional instrument, the sound of which can add a wonderful splendor to the Church's ceremonies and powerfully lift up men's minds to God and high things.[78]

Other instruments, meanwhile, were also permitted if they were dignified and added to the "edification of the faithful," although the exercise of judgment was somewhat subjective.[79] As opposed to Pius X's *Tra Le Sollecitudini*, which relegated the role of the organ to primarily one of vocal accompaniment, *Musicam Sacram* acknowledged the use of solo organ music in the liturgy, along with its role as a supporting instrument for singing. The document elaborates:

> In sung or said Masses, the organ, or other instrument legitimately admitted, can be used to accompany the singing of the choir and the

[76] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 351.

[77] The Sacred Congregation of Rites, "Musicam Sacram," 84.

[78] The Sacred Congregation of Rites, "Musicam Sacram," 96.

[79] The Sacred Congregation of Rites, "Musicam Sacram," 96.

> people; it can also be played solo at the beginning before the priest reaches the altar, at the Offertory, at the Communion, and at the end of Mass. The same rule, with necessary adaptations, can be applied to other sacred celebrations.[80]

It is noteworthy that nowhere in the document's discussion of the organ is there a mention that the organ should no longer be used; on the contrary, the above reading can be interpreted as a call for a greater use of the organ than before, in both solo and accompanimental capacities. Also in contrast to Pius X's motu proprio, *Musicam Sacram* stresses the importance of employing skilled organists and musicians, noting that it is "highly desirable" that they possess the "skill to play properly the instrument entrusted to them," as well as a deep understanding of the liturgy so that when improvising "*ex tempore*" the liturgical celebration can be enriched and participation encouraged.[81]

Implementation of New Norms and the Pipe Organ

Despite what would seem to be an encouragement, as well as an approval, from Conciliar and Post Conciliar documents to use the pipe organ in Catholic liturgy, as well as retain some of the past repertoire of liturgical music, the new norms have been interpreted in a variety of different ways according to individual preferences. Some progressive liturgists, like Archbishop Rembert Weakland, OSB, felt that liturgical music of the past had no proper place in the revised liturgy since all musical works reflect the value of the age in which they were written, which do not necessarily reflect the values of the present age. Weakland

[80] The Sacred Congregation of Rites, "Musicam Sacram," 96.

[81] The Sacred Congregation of Rites, "Musicam Sacram," 97.

writes, "We have no music of a liturgical golden age, because the treasures we have are the product of ages that do not represent an ideal of theological thinking in relationship to the liturgy."[82] He goes on to chide those who see "the holy in the archaic," who have left church musicians with "inherited baggage" that lives memorialized in church documents.[83] On the other hand, Archbishop Weakland does not address how one should continually incorporate new music into the liturgy, and the practicality of doing so with a congregation of people, who, for the most part, have little formal training in music. Despite the Archbishop's disdain for the use of older liturgical music in the Mass, it should be noted that the pipe organ, nonetheless, figured prominently in the Archbishop's newly-renovated Cathedral of Saint John the Evangelist, Milwaukee. The new organ's prominence was so great, in fact, that it drew much criticism, including a letter from the Vatican's Congregation for Divine Worship asking the Archbishop to hold off on his renovation plans.[84]

Even in instances where the organ was retained in the liturgy, use of the instrument in the newly-revised liturgy faced challenges as the organ was required lead congregational singing. Some liturgists like Frank Quinn, O.P. argue that Catholics were ill-prepared for Council's demands on congregational singing in

---

[82] Rembert Weakland, O.S.B. "Music and Liturgy in Evolution," in *Crisis in Church Music?* Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference. 1967. 4-5.

[83] Weakland, "Music and Liturgy in Evolution," 10-11.

[84] "Weakland Asked to Stop Cathedral Renovations," *America.* 184, no. 20 (April 2001), under "Signs of the Times,"http://www.americamagazine.org/content/article.cfm?article_id=1762&s=2 (Accessed 1 October 2010).

the vernacular. The limited hymnody that was familiar to many Catholics, as noted earlier, was often at odds with the texts of the daily liturgy, or was weak from a theological standpoint, thus, "little of this music was fit for liturgical usage."[85] Because so few of the pre-Vatican II hymns were acceptable for the revised liturgy, Catholic composers following the Council were frequently forced to "borrow" from Protestant hymnody, with confused Catholics struggling to learn new, unfamiliar hymns, in addition to learning musical settings of the parts of the Mass.[86] This situation posed unforeseen challenges to organists at Catholic churches who were not accustomed to leading robust congregational singing with the organ. As contemporary liturgical composer, Jan Michael Joncas recounts, the introduction of Protestant-style hymnody with effective leadership from the organ was, and remains, difficult for Catholic parishes, adding that "organ registrations deemed strong enough to lead congregational song by North American Lutherans are frequently considered too strident and loud by their Catholic confreres."[87] Simply put, many American Catholics, who were used to the organ as a sort of background accompaniment for liturgy or to accompany soft chants, did not know how to react to the organ taking a prominent role in terms of leading congregational singing at Mass. Another challenge also came from the differing goals of liturgical musicians and some parishioners who have different ideas

[85] Quinn, "The Problems of Hymnody in Catholic Worship," 313.

[86] Quinn, "The Problems of Hymnody in Catholic Worship," 312.

[87] Jan Michael Joncas, "Liturgical Music as Music: The Contribution of the Human Sciences," *Liturgy and Music: Lifetime Learning,* Leaver, A. Robin and Joyce Ann Zimmerman, eds. (Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press. 1998), 222.

concerning what facilitates musical participation. In a recent survey conducted by the National Association of Pastoral Musicians, church musicians and ordinary lay people were asked what helps encourage congregational singing. While the majority of musicians responded with several ideas, including, "leadership of organ and instruments," a "meaningful text," or the "leadership of cantor or director," most of the laity responded with "familiar melody" and "easy to sing."[88]

Posing an even greater challenge to the use of the organ in post-Vatican II liturgy was the overriding sense of experimentation by clergy, religious, and laity eager to implement changes without necessarily understanding what the changes actually were, or even bothering to consult the Council's *Constitutions* or the later *Musicam Sacram*. Jesuit Father Keith Pecklers elaborates on the liturgical atmosphere of the typical American post-Vatican II parish, and how some of the most enthusiastic implementers of liturgical reforms were able to stray so far from the actual directives:

> Depending on the parish, and especially on its pastor, liturgy became more democratic. Liturgy committees were formed and began adding "creative" elements to the Sunday Mass: home-grown eucharistic prayers and creeds, tie-dyed chasubles, parish song books including texts to be sung to the tune of Bob Dylan's "Blowin' in the Wind." In retrospect, it must be honestly stated that much of the well-intentioned liturgical creativity of the 60's and 70's was ill-informed, that the American church was not adequately educated for radical liturgical changes and that the enthusiastic implementers of change were by and large in no position to offer that education.[89]

[88] "Musicians, People in Pews Differ on Helps for Singing," *America* 196, no. 3 (January 29, 2007): 6.

[89] Keith F. Pecklers. "The Crisis in American Catholic Worship" in *America*. 291. Vol. 16, No. 3 (Autumn, 1998), 289-310.

Peckler's observation echoes what Frank Quinn also noted in his observations of post-Vatican II Catholic hymnody; while Conciliar and Post Conciliar documents provide no shortage of ways to encourage active musical participation, little is given in terms of how this should be implemented or how the faithful should be educated given their newfound role in the liturgy. Some liturgists, like Father Brian Harrison, suggest that the problems we face in today's liturgical affairs stem not from the Vatican II documents themselves, but from changes instituted after the council that "went far beyond those the great majority of Council Fathers had in mind when they approved and signed *Sacrosanctum Concilium.*"[90]

As Catholic musician Jeffrey Tucker observes, the musical situation frequently found in Catholic churches in the present day is one of compromise, "…and each Mass will have a bit of piano, a bit of organ, a bit of guitar, and so on. This is what is called an eclectic approach."[91] Tucker astutely observes that compromise often pleases no one: instead, musicians from all sides can become disenchanted:

> [The eclectic approach] seems viable for a few weeks or months, and then the dam breaks. Musicians leave the parish. Choir members stop attending because no one wants to sing music he or she hates. The talented organist quits. The guitar players take off too. All that remain in the end are the

[90] Brian W. Harrison, O.S. "The Postconcilar Eucharistic Liturgy: Planning a 'Reform of the Reform,'" in *The Reform of the Reform? A Liturgical Debate: Reform or Return*. Thomas M. Kocik, ed. San Francisco: Ignatius Press. 2003. 170.

[91] Jeffrey A. Tucker, *Sing like a Catholic,* (Richmond, Virginia: Church Music Association of America. 2009), 87.

> unprincipled people with moderate talent who will do anything for a small paycheck.[92]

Tucker's characterization of musicians who make musical compromises as "unprincipled" –a sort of musical mercenary – is perhaps unfair, since the nature of church music requires a certain amount of give and take with various personalities in the parish. Nonetheless, he underscores one of the difficulties in creating programs that aim to please everyone.

Deleterious experimentation within the liturgy and the lack of cohesion and identity in some music programs clearly damaged the organ's role in Catholic music. Some Catholic musicians also believe the organ suffered due to the lackluster state of instruments in average-to-smaller sized parishes. Arthur Jones, former editor of the *National Catholic Reporter*, explains that this happened in most parishes prior to Second Vatican Council. Some of the smaller churches removed their pipe organs altogether, while larger churches and Cathedrals had better instruments, and were more likely to retain them.[93] Nonetheless, just as the liturgical climate changed between the years prior to and immediately following the Second Vatican Council, so too, the Catholic Church in America continued to experience other changes, with the creation of a number of groups dedicated to a more literal implementation of the Council's norms, along with groups dedicated

[92] Tucker, Sing Like a Catholic, 87.

[93] Arthur Jones, "Struggling to catch the beat," *National Catholic Reporter* 37, no. 37 (August 24, 2001): 3, *Academic Search Premier*, EBSCO*host* (accessed 1 October 2010).

to the preservation of the liturgy and music of previous times. This climate of restoration would ultimately find its impetus in the papacy of Pope Benedict XVI.

CHAPTER 4

SIGNS OF LIFE: THE REVIVAL OF THE ORGAN IN SOME CATHOLIC GROUPS

Some Current Schools of Thought in Catholic Liturgy

While Vatican II is frequently seen as the catalyst for radical changes in the liturgy and its music, the years following the Council have proven equally tumultuous, a saga between those who favor increased liturgical experimentation and those who desire a stronger continuity with the past. For the pipe organ, circumstances are no less contentious. A number of American Catholics hastened to abandon the pipe organ as a symbol of the past, usually in favor of instruments perceived as more "in touch" with contemporary society. Others, weary of sacred music that, in their estimation, was musically poor and theologically weak, sought ways to reincorporate the organ into Catholic liturgy, along with Gregorian chant, congregational hymnody, and polyphonic works. The principal proponents of organ in the liturgy following the Second Vatican Council include: (1) "traditionalist" groups, who favor a return to pre-Vatican II liturgical ritual with little or no modification, and more or less reject the reforms of Vatican II; (2) so-called "conservative" groups, who, while accepting the need for liturgical reform and the validity of Vatican II, recognize the need for continuity with the past and desire a more solemn and dignified liturgy, which they understand to be an "authentic" understanding of the Council's reforms; and (3) "progressive" Catholics, who support more wide-scale liturgical reform, yet see the pipe organ as an ideal way to support and encourage congregational singing, and thereby

enabling the faithful to have a more "active participation" encouraged so frequently in the Vatican II documents.

Traditionalist Movements

While the majority of Catholics in the U.S. cooperated to a greater or lesser degree in the liturgical reforms of Vatican II, some Catholics rejected the reforms – or, at least, the interpretation of these reforms by clergy and others who were anxious to become up-to-date – as a violent departure from the Church's liturgical patrimony. Pope Benedict XVI acknowledges Catholics who remained deeply attached to the Roman liturgical rites as they existed before the Council in his recent *motu proprio Summorum Pontificium*:

> Many people who clearly accepted the binding character of the Second Vatican Council, and were faithful to the Pope and the Bishops, nonetheless also desired to recover the form of the sacred liturgy that was dear to them. This occurred above all because in many places celebrations were not faithful to prescription in the new Missal, but the latter actually was understood as authorizing or even requiring creativity, which frequently led to deformations of the liturgy which were hard to bear.[94]

In the above passage, the pope betrays his empathy with those who chose to return to the old Missal, adding, "I am speaking from experience, since I too lived through that period with all its hopes and confusion. And I have seen how arbitrary deformations of the liturgy caused deep pain to individuals totally rooted in the faith of the Church."[95] Benedict XVI also acknowledges one of the largest

[94] Pope Benedict XVI, "Letter Of His Holiness Benedict XVI To The Bishops On The Occasion Of The Publication Of The Apostolic Letter 'Motu Proprio Data' *Summorum Pontificum* On The Use Of The Roman Liturgy Prior To The Reform Of 1970," *Sacred Music* 134, no. 3 (Fall 2007):46-47.

[95] Benedict XVI, "Letter Of His Holiness Benedict XVI To The Bishops On The Occasion Of The Publication Of The Apostolic Letter 'Motu Proprio Data' *Summorum Pontificum,*" 46-47.

"traditionalist" organizations, the Society of Saint Pius X, a society of priests and supporting laity dedicated to celebrating the liturgical rites only according to the pre-Conciliar books, founded by French Archbishop Marcel Lefebvre in 1970. Lefebvre was excommunicated in 1988 after he ordained four bishops in his society without the permission of Pope John Paul II.[96] Pope Benedict XVI, in an effort to reconcile the Society, which claims to number over 150,000 members,[97] with the Holy See lifted the excommunication that had been place on the four bishops consecrated by Lefebvre.[98] Despite this effort at reconciliation, the Society of Saint Pius X has not yet accepted the pope's offers to full communion with the Church. One of the obstacles to Society of Saint Pius X reuniting with the Roman Catholic Church is that members of the Society must accept the reforms of the Second Vatican Council as valid, along with the teachings of the past five popes.[99]

While some traditionalist groups like the Society of Saint Pius X are wary of reconciliation, other traditionalists have embraced Pope Benedict XVI's efforts toward making pre-Conciliar rites available for any Catholic who desires them.

One of the most important ways Pope Benedict XVI has accomplished this is through his 2007 motu proprio *Summorum Pontificium*, which lifted the

---

[96] Bryan Cones, "Who are the Lefebvrites, and are they Catholic?," *U.S. Catholic* 74, no. 4 (April 2009): 41, Academic *Search Premier*, EBSCO*host* (accessed 1 October 2010).

[97] Cones, "Who are the Lefebvrites, and are they Catholic?," 41.

[98] "Reaching Right," *America* 200, no. 6 (February 23, 2009): 5, *Academic Search Premier*, EBSCO*host* (accessed 2 October 2010).

[99] "Reaching Right," 5.

majority of restrictions on the celebration of the Mass and sacraments according to pre-Conciliar books that had existed since the publication of the *Novus Ordo Missae* in 1970. The pope, aware that some might view uninhibited use of the pre-Conciliar missal as a threat to the liturgical reforms of the Second Vatican Council, assures the faithful that this fear is "unfounded," adding that the revised missal and the missal of John XXIII are not to be considered two "different" rites, but rather "it is a matter of a twofold use of one and the same rite."[100] Thus, according to this legislation, the revised liturgical rites may peacefully coexist along with those in place before the Second Vatican Council.

The implementation of Benedict's *Summorum Pontificum* may also have an effect of the use of the organ in the sacred liturgy, as those who celebrate according to the older form of the Missal must also abide by the former liturgical directives; this includes primacy of the organ as the Church's proper liturgical instrument, along with the restrictions on other instruments that were in place. As Pope Benedict XVI stipulates, even despite the later changes that were incorporated into the liturgy, including those regarding sacred music, stating that priests should use "one Missal or the other" – in other words, the two Missals should not be mixed – and that priests may celebrate Mass publically using the older Missal without obtaining special permission.[101]

---

[100] Benedict XVI, "Letter Of His Holiness Benedict XVI To The Bishops On The Occasion Of The Publication Of The Apostolic Letter 'Motu Proprio Data' *Summorum Pontificum,*" 46.

[101] Benedict XVI, "Summorum Pontificum," *Sacred Music* 134, no. 3 (Fall 2007); 49. ProQuest Direct Complete (accessed 11 October 2010).

It is probably unrealistic to expect most American Catholics at present to suddenly demand Latin Masses according to the pre-Conciliar books. According to a study taken in 2009 by the Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate, based at Georgetown University, sixty-three percent of Catholics surveyed said they had a neutral opinion about the increased availability of the pre-Conciliar Mass, while twenty-five percent favored the idea; only twelve percent opposed the idea.[102] Given the seeming openness to the use of the older Missal, if not whole-hearted support of it, it is possible that the older liturgical rites will continue to be offered in some churches throughout the United States, offering some hope of continuing the older form of the tradition, including Gregorian chant, polyphonic Mass settings, and the use of the pipe organ. At the same time, those who provide music for such liturgies, especially organists, must decide how closely they will follow directives such as *Tra Le Sollecitudini*, which relegates the organ to a mostly accompanimental role, or whether to take into consideration *Divini Cultis Sanctitatem*, which offers more possibilities for the organ.. Also, while a majority of Catholics surveyed had a neutral attitude toward the old Missal, the most affable demographic were Catholics born between 1943 and 1961, while the age group that was the least supportive of the old Missal came from the "Millennial" generation, those born in 1982 and after.[103] This raises questions about the sustainability of older liturgical forms, especially once the age

[102] "Latin Mass: Two-thirds of Catholics have no opinion." *National Catholic Reporter* 45, no. 23 (September 4, 2009): 4, *Academic Search Premier*, EBSCO*host* (accessed 1 October 2010).

[103] "Latin Mass: Two-thirds of Catholics have no opinion," 4.

groups who are the most supportive die off, leaving behind younger generations who have little experience or interest in the older liturgical forms.

Conservative Movements and "The Reform of the Reform"

Different people may react differently to the same thing. For example, while traditionalists reacted to the liturgy reforms, or, in some cases, liturgical abuses, by returning to the pre-Conciliar Missal, others, supportive of the Second Vatican Council's directives, nonetheless sought a more literal interpretation of them. Accordingly, while traditionalist groups began forming in the United States and elsewhere, groups dedicated to an "authentic" celebration of the Church's liturgical rites also appeared. The Church Music Association of America represents one such group of American Catholics. The Association began in 1964, near the close of the Second Vatican Council, combined the 1874 American Society of Saint Cecilia, which furthered the musical ideals of the Cecilian movement, and the 1913 Saint Gregory Society.[104] One of the Association's primary aims was the advancement of the norms defined in the Church's instruction on sacred music, *Musicam Sacram* (1967), along with aiding Catholic church musicians who "have a special interest in music and liturgy, active in advancing Gregorian chant, Renaissance polyphony, and other forms of sacred music, including new composition, for liturgical use."[105]

[104]The Church Music Association of America. "Supporting Sacred Music," The Church Music Association of America Website, http://www.musicasacra.com/ (accessed 13 September 2010).

[105] Church Music Association, "Supporting Sacred Music."

While drawing its heritage from the Cecilian movement, The Church Music Association of America takes a more inclusive approach than its predecessor, especially regarding the performance of orchestral Mass settings in the Viennese tradition. One of the featured liturgies in their 2009 convention in Chicago, Illinois, was a Latin High Mass done according to the pre-Conciliar Missal, now referred to as the "extraordinary" form of the Mass. The Mass, held at St. John Cantius Parish, featured Franz Joseph Haydn's *Kleine Orgelmesse* accompanied on the organ by David Hughes and a chamber orchestra.[106] This choice of music is perhaps indicative of the association's incorporation of the norms set forth by the liturgy constitution of the Second Vatican Council documents, which allow for a greater variety of instruments in sacred music, while at the same time showing a predilection for sacred music from previous centuries.

The group also demonstrates support for the pipe organ and its literature, demonstrating ways it can be used to full advantage in the revised and pre-Conciliar liturgies. During the same 2009 convention, an organ recital was incorporated into the solemn celebration of Compline, also known as "Night Prayer," played by Brother Jonathan Ryan, S.J.C., a member of the recently-founded men's religious community, the Canons Regular of Saint John Cantius. His program included Maurice Duruflé's *Prélude, Adagio, et Choral Varié sur le*

[106] W Pat Cunningham, and Carolyn Cunningham, "Sacred Music Colloquium 2009," *Sacred Music* 136, no. 3 (Fall 2009): 67. ProQuest Direct Complete (accessed 4 September 2010).

thème du "Veni Creator" and Max Reger's chorale fantasy *Hallelujah! Gott zu loben*.[107]

With regard to the revised Missal, the Church Music Association favors a careful observance of liturgical documents, encouraging the sung participation of the congregation at Mass, while continuing to use traditional repertoire, especially Gregorian chant. Similar groups, such as Adoremus, which came into being in 1995, exists to promote "authentic reform" of the liturgy according to the teachings of the Second Vatican Council's Constitutions on the Sacred Liturgy, and to rediscover the Church's "beauty, holiness and power of the Church's liturgical tradition."[108]

Moderate-to-Progressive Groups and the Use of the Organ

In contrast to the Church Music Association of America, the National Association of Pastoral Musicians demonstrates a more moderate to progressive interpretation of the Church's instruction on music while still maintaining interest in some traditional liturgical idioms, including the pipe organ. According to church music historian, Albert Blackwell, the great debate surrounding liturgical music during the Second Vatican Council centered on the "view from the altar" versus the "view from the choir-loft."[109] In North America, Blackwell asserts that these competing views are still evident between the sacred music journals, with

---

[107] Cunningham, "Sacred Music Colloquium 2009," 67.

[108] Richard J. Schuller, "From the Editors: Welcome to Adoremus," *Sacred Music* 122, no. 3 (Fall 1995); 4.

[109] Albert L. Blackwell, *The Sacred in Music* (Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 2000), 147.

the National Association of Pastoral Musicians' *Pastoral Music* representing the "camp at the altar," while the Church Music Association of America's *Sacred Music* journal represents the "camp of the choir-loft." Blackwell recalls Sister Miriam Therese Winter, a Catholic nun and liturgical music composer, who summarized the two groups as those who emphasized the congregation's "active participation" against those who emphasize the "Church's rich musical tradition."[110] These generalizations are somewhat simplistic, but they do illustrate the basic differences that exist between the two groups.

As the National Association of Pastoral Musicians explains in a brief mission statement, their primary goal is to "foster the art of musical liturgy," adding that "the members of NPM serve the Catholic Church in the United States as musicians, clergy, liturgists, and other leaders of prayer."[111] In contrast to the Church Music Association's stated goals of being faithful to ecclesiastical instructions on sacred music, the language employed by the National Association of Pastoral Musicians, emphasizing the "art" of liturgical music, seems more open to personal interpretation; the absence of any mention of the Church's liturgical documents suggests this as well. One of the ways the Association helps to develop liturgical music is through certification programs, including a "Basic Organist Certificate" and "Organ Service Playing and Colleague Certificates," administered in conjunction with the American Guild of

[110] Blackwell, *The Sacred in Music,* 147.

[111] National Association of Pastoral Musicians. "NPM Mission Statement," National Association of Pastoral Musicians Website. http://www.npm.org/presence/mission.htm (accessed 2 September 2010).

Organists.[112] Daniel Wyatt, in describing the programs adds that the goal of the certifications is to "equip you better as a professional or amateur musician in improving your musical, liturgical, and pastoral skills."[113] Thus, while not appearing to be as stalwart in their observance of the Church's instruction on sacred music as some more conservative groups, the National Association of Pastoral Musicians shares an interest in helping church musicians to develop their skills.

Prominent Themes in Present-day Catholic liturgy and the Organ

With Pope Benedict XVI's ascent to the papacy in 2005, a more conservative attitude toward liturgical music can be seen in certain groups, such as the United States Council of Catholic Bishops. Their 2007 document on liturgical music, *Sing to the Lord: Music in Divine Worship*, reaffirms the Second Vatican Council's call for active participation, but also affirms the role of the organ in the liturgy. Like other church documents on music, *Sing to the Lord* states that the organist's main purpose is the leading of congregational song, "The primary role of the organist…is to lead and sustain the singing of the assembly and of the choir, cantor, and psalmist, without dominating or overpowering them."[114] Like other documents on sacred music from the *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* and onward, directives are given on how to use the organ for the

[112] Dan Wyatt, "Pastoral Musicians: Certified or Certifiable," *Pastoral Music* 33, no. 1 (October 2008); 66.

[113] Wyatt, "Pastoral Musicians: Certified or Certifiable," 66.

[114] The United States Council of Catholic Bishops, *Sing to the Lord: Music in Divine Worship* (Washington, D.C.: 2007), 13.

liturgy, but using subjective terms. For example, the Bishops give no qualification as to what constitutes leadership from the organ, or how much sound constitutes domination of the singers. Once again, enough room is left for individual interpretation. Beyond the admonition not to "overpower" the voices, *Sing to the Lord* virtually exudes praise for the instrument, not just for liturgical purposes, but also as a way to reach the community at large:

> In addition to its ability to lead and sustain congregational singing, the sound of the pipe organ is most suited for solo playing of sacred music in the Liturgy at appropriate moments. Pipe organs also play an important evangelical role in the Church's outreach to the wider community in sacred concerts, music series, and other musical and cultural programs. For all of these reasons, the place of the organ should be taken into account from the onset in the planning process for the building or renovation of churches."[115]

The American Catholic Bishops' positive attitude toward the organ reinforces the instrument's importance. A number of recent organ installations, discussed in greater depth later in this paper, also point to a renewal of enthusiasm for the instrument – perhaps for its social dimensions as much as for its liturgical ones. Yet organs only live up to their potential if there are talented people willing and able to play them. For the Catholic Church in the United States, the future of the organ also depends on the future of organ study, especially in programs specifically dealing with the needs of Catholic liturgy.

[115] Catholic Bishops, *Sing to the Lord,* 27.

CHAPTER 5

ORGAN STUDY IN CATHOLIC UNIVERSITIES IN THE UNITED STATES

Catholic colleges and universities in the United States have a long legacy of providing organ instruction, including organ performance and sacred music concentrations. While some such programs disappeared after the reforms of Vatican II, such as the Pius X School for Sacred Music in Manhattanville, NY, others show signs of growth, or at least, viability. These include newly-founded sacred music programs at the University of Notre Dame in South Bend, Indiana, and Ave Maria University in Naples, Florida, as well as existing programs such as the ones at Catholic University of the America in Washington, D.C., and St. John's University in Collegeville, Minnesota. In all, the state of organ instruction, like the instrument's liturgical use, is reflective of the overall atmosphere of flux present in the American Catholic community.

St. Pius X School of Liturgical Music

Some organ programs in Catholic music schools did not survive in the aftermath of Vatican II. One of the most notable is the Pius X School of Liturgical Music in Manhattanville, NY (later relocated to Purchase, NY). Pius X School, founded under the auspices of the Religious Sisters of the Sacred Heart at Manhattanville College, was at the forefront of the Liturgical Movement in the U.S. from its founding in 1916 until its closure in 1969. Inspired by Pope Pius X's 1903 *Motu proprio* on church music reform, Mother Georgia Stevens, a member of the Religious of the Sacred Heart, and Justine Ward, an influential pedagogue of Gregorian chant and Catholic music educator, founded what was to become the

Pius X School of Liturgical Music in an effort to teach a high level of liturgical music to the students and nuns at Manhattanville College and improve the quality of the music at liturgical services.[116]

In addition to a strong emphasis on instruction in the "Solesmes method" of Gregorian chant, the pipe organ was featured in the school's music program. In one of the school's first highly-publicized concerts, French concert organist Joseph Bonnet played a recital in the college chapel on April 28, 1919. The program was entitled "The Influence of Gregorian Chant on the Organ Compositions of the XVI, XVII, XVIII, XIX Centuries," featuring organ works by Frescobaldi, Grigny, D'Indy, Titelouze, and Bonnet himself.[117] Mother Stevens' schola of young girls sang each chant following the organ piece based on it, accompanied judiciously by Becket Gibbs on the harmonium. The recital garnered positive reviews, both for Bonnet's program, and for Gibbs' elegant accompaniments that enabled the chant to be heard in "all its beauty and nobility."[118] Joseph Bonnet maintained a long association with Pius X School, visiting whenever he made concert tours of the U.S.[119] He also designed the organ

[116] Catherine A. Carroll, *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music: 1916-1969* (St. Louis, MO: Society of the Sacred Heart, 1989), 11-12.

[117] Carroll, *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music,* 98.

[118] Carroll, *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music*, 17, 98.

[119] Carroll, *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music,* 16.

in the school's Pius X Hall, built by the Casavant Frères Company in 1923 and financed by Justine Ward and her devotees.[120]

The organ culture at Pius X School developed and expanded under lay musicians like Ward and Bonnet, and also under clergy and religious men and women. In particular, two Benedictine monks, Dom Mocquéreau and Dom Gatard of the Abbaye de Saint-Pierre in Solesmes, France were highly influential in this regard. Dom Gatard stayed at Pius X School from June through September of 1920, and founded the New York Chapter of Catholic organists.[121] In following decades, the school relocated from Mahattanville to a larger campus in Purchase, New York. New buildings were erected, including a new chapel in 1962 with a three-manual pipe organ.[122] 1962 was a notable year for another reason, the opening session of the Second Vatican Council by Pope John XXIII. By the mid-1960's, Pius X School responded to the proposed liturgical changes of Vatican II and began to offer courses on music for congregational use, including a wider use of English vernacular hymns and songs in the liturgy.[123] In time, the promulgation of a reformed, vernacular liturgy proved to be the demise of a "curriculum

---

[120] Carroll, *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music,* 115. Francis Brancaleone, "Justine Ward and the Fostering of an American Solesmes Chant Tradition," *Sacred Music* 136, no. 3 (Fall 2009): 8.

[121] Carroll, *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music,* 17-19.

[122] Carroll, *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music,* 79.

[123] Carroll, *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music,* 80-82. Marianna Huck, "The Role of the Pius X School of Music in the Liturgical Movement" (Master's thesis, Catholic University of America, Washington D.C. 1965), 57.

designed for the Latin liturgy."[124] In 1969, the school's final year of operation, efforts were made to offer relevant courses in sacred music, including "Composing for the New Liturgy," and "Organ Skills and Literature," taught by G. Huntington Byles, organist at Trinity Church, New Haven, CT.[125] Despite these efforts, then-President McCormack of Manhattanville College, announced at the end of the academic year that the Pius X School would be merged with the college music department, effectively ending the School's legacy of liturgical music instruction. In 1971, Manhattanville College became non-denominational, ending its official affiliation with the Religious of the Sacred Heart and the Catholic Church.[126] At present, Manhattanville College offers Bachelor's degrees in music, and organ instruction is offered, though not in the context of a liturgical music program as it was done in the days of the Pius X School.[127]

Recently-Founded Catholic Organ Programs

While some programs that featured the organ at American Catholic colleges died in the tumultuous climate of Vatican II, others have emerged in recent times as a response to a growing number of Catholics who favor a more literal interpretation of the Church's documents on sacred music. One example of

---

[124] Carroll, *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music,* 87.

[125] Carroll, *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music,* 88.

[126] Mahnattanville College,"History," Manhattanville College Website. http://www.manhattanville.edu/AboutManhattanville/History/Default.aspx (Accessed 16 August 2010).

[127] Manhattanville College, "Requirements," Manhattanville College, Music Department Website. http://www.manhattanville.edu/AcademicsandResearch/AcademicDepartments/Music/Requirements.aspx (Accessed 16 August 2010).

a well-known Catholic University's revival in organ and liturgical music studies is the recently-founded Graduate Sacred Music program at the University of Notre Dame, South Bend, IN, which endeavors to respond to "the need for high quality music and liturgical formation."[128] In the area of organ studies, the university boasts of recently-constructed facilities and the installation of a north-German-Baroque style organ made by American organ builder Paul Fritts in 2004.[129] The two-manual organ contains thirty-five stops and is housed in a reverberant hall designed specifically for the instrument. Fritts praised the space, adding, "The building they've built, and the room for the organ, is the best we've ever worked in…That's a strong statement, because the room acoustics can make or break an instrument."[130] The Fritts organ, along with the inauguration of the university's sacred music program, represents an initiative to make the organ a viable part of Catholic liturgy in the United States, and provide a new generation of organists with a firm knowledge of Catholic liturgy and solid musical skill to lead music programs in Catholic parishes across the country.

Another recently-established American Catholic college is Ave Maria University, created in 2003 by Domino's Pizza founder, Tom Monaghan, who desired to build a Catholic town and university in Florida that would remain

[128]University of Notre Dame, "Master of Sacred Music, Program of Study." University of Notre Dame, Department of Theology Website. http://theology.nd.edu/graduate-program/master-of-sacred-music/program/ (accessed 16 August 2010)

[129] Andrew S. Hughes, "Pulling out all the stops; Reyes Hall's organ designed with Bach in mind" *The South Bend Tribune*, September 17, 2004, SS8.

[130] Hughes, "Pulling out all the stops."

faithful to the morals and teachings of the Church.[131] The novel concept of creating a Catholic residential development and university with a strict moral code met with criticism, especially from students and parents who felt the strict rules were a violation of personal freedom.[132] Despite these challenges, Ave Maria University continues to expand its offerings, including a Sacred Music program, and music faculty, with a full-time organ professor. On March 25, 2009, a new organ was dedicated for the university oratory. In a strikingly unconventional move for an institution that stresses the importance of tradition, the organ selected was a four-manual virtual pipe organ built by digital organ makers Marshall and Ogletree, designed by American concert organist, Cameron Carpenter.[133] One is immediately struck by the dichotomy between groups that claim total obedience to church legislation – for example, the liturgy constitutions which specify that pride of place be given to "pipe" organs without mentioning other types of organs such as digital ones – and the reality of decisions made out of personal taste or practical need.

Well-Established Catholic Music Programs Featuring the Organ

Aside from the Pius X School of Liturgical Music mentioned earlier, the other most notable early effort at teaching Catholic sacred music at the university

[131] Mary Beth Marklein, "Catholic College Crosses New Ground," *USA Today,* August 1, 2007, http://www.usatoday.com/news/religion/2007-07-31-avemaria-growth_N.htm. (Accessed 31 August 2010).

[132] Marklein, "Catholic College Crosses New Ground."

[133] Ave Maria University, "AMU Celebrates Feast of the Annunciation With New Award, State of the Art Organ, Exterior Lights and More," Ave Maria University website, http://www.avemaria.edu/news/248.html. (Accessed 31 August 2010).

level began at Catholic University of America in Washington, D.C. Unlike the Pius X School, which closed in the aftermath of the Second Vatican Council, the School of Liturgical Music at Catholic University of America continues to this day, now known as the Institute of Sacred Music. Father Joseph Kelly writes in 1921 about the university's dreams of offering various courses in sacred music through the creation of a sacred music program, ranging from "culture courses" in sacred music open to students of any discipline to a doctoral degree in sacred music.[134] Father Kelly shared his lofty aims for the program to become a "centre for artistic work in sacred music, as it already is for scientific and literary work.[135] In 1929 this dream became a reality with the establishment of the School of Liturgical Music at the university, emphasizing Gregorian chant studies according to the Solesmes method, sacred polyphony, and organ studies.[136]

The Catholic University of America and the Pius X School of Liturgical Music began near the same time and in the same atmosphere of liturgical music reform championed by the monks of Solesmes and the Liturgical Movement, Catholic University was thus able to continue where the Pius X School of Liturgical Music left off as a Catholic school for sacred music. Justine Ward, who co-founded the Pius X School, was also one of the founding members of the

[134] F. Joseph Kelly, "Sacred Music and the University," *The Ecclesiastical Review* 64, (January 1921); 527.

[135] Kelly, "Sacred Music and the University," 529.

[136] Pierre Combe, *Justine Ward and Solesmes* (Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1987), 254.

School of Liturgical Music at Catholic University.[137] She later broke relations with the Pius X School after a disagreement with Mother Stevens and the school's board over the chant curriculum.[138] Later in 1967, after a teaching stint in Europe, Ward returned to the United States and donated generously to the school of music at Catholic University; so much so that the university's primary music building was named after her, as well as a Center for Ward Method Studies.[139] The Ward method is still published by Catholic University, and instruction in the method at the university's Center for Ward Method Studies continues to this day.[140] In 2005, Catholic University of America inaugurated its Institute of Sacred Music, which offers advanced degrees in sacred music and concentrations on Choral Music, Organ Performance, and Composition.[141] The Saint Vincent de Paul Chapel in the Institute of Sacred Music houses a three-manual Schudi pipe organ, Opus 18,[142] and students also have access to several organs in the Basilica of the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception, the largest being the Gallery Organ, Möller Opus 9702, installed in 1964.[143]

---

[137] Combe, *Justine Ward and Solesmes,* 254.

[138] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 223.

[139] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform,* 223.

[140] Schaefer, *Catholic Music Through the Ages,* 122.

[141] Catholic University of America, "Who We Are," Catholic University of America, Sacred Music Website, http://sacredmusic.cua.edu/Who-We-Are.cfm (accessed 31 August 2010).

[142] Catholic University of America, "Schudi Organ," Catholic University of America, Sacred Music Website, http://sacredmusic.cua.edu/SchudiOrgan.cfm (accessed 31 August 2010).

[143] Peter Latona, et al., "The Basilica of the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception: Upper Church Organ Renovation Project," *The Diapason* 93, no. 3 (March 2002), 23.

Aside from the larger programs mentioned, like the ones at the University of Notre Dame and the Catholic University of America, smaller programs exist in the United States to teach organ within the framework of Catholic liturgical music. Two of the most noteworthy include the program in Liturgical Music at Saint John's University in Collegeville, Minnesota, and the program in Liturgical Music at Duquesne University in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. The former program was founded by the Benedictine monks of Saint John's Abbey, Collegeville, who were among the first to import the ideas of the Liturgical Movement to the United States early in the twentieth-century.[144] The abbey and its university became a center for studies in liturgy and theology as well as in liturgical music. The university's School of Theology offers a Master of Arts Degree in Liturgical Music, with concentrations on Organ, Choral Conducting and Composition.[145] Duquesne University, another prominent Catholic university, began offering instruction in sacred music in 1930, and today offers bachelors and masters degrees in organ performance and sacred music.[146] Courses in the program include, hymnody, solo literature, hymn playing, and improvisation, taught

[144] Pecklers, The *Unread Vision,* 18-19.

[145]Saint John's University, "Program Outcomes, M.A. in Liturgical Music," Saint John's School of Theology Website. http://www1.csbsju.edu/sot/academicprograms/degree_MaLiturgicalMusic_outcomes.htm (accessed 31 August 2010).

[146] Fred Moleck, "Sacred Music at Duquesne," *Pastoral Music* 21, no. 2 (December-January 1997): 49.

presently by Ann Labounsky, a scholar of the organ music of twentieth-century French composer Jean Langlais.[147]

Growing from its roots in the Liturgical Movement and sacred music reform in the early twentieth-century, the tradition of organ and sacred music study continues in several American Catholic institutions of higher learning. Nonetheless, challenges abound as the role of the organ and the overall nature of sacred music as defined by the Church's current instructions continue to be interpreted by Roman Catholic clergy and musicians. Despite these challenges, new programs, like the ones at the University of Notre Dame and Ave Maria University, along with older ones, like the Institute of Sacred Music at the Catholic University of America, continue to train organists and other musicians specifically in Catholic liturgical music. While their continued existence in the future is not guaranteed, their presence in the early twenty-first-century offers hope for those interested in continuing a rich musical tradition.

[147] Moleck, "Sacred Music at Duquesne," 49.

CHAPTER 6

THE CATHOLIC ORGAN LEGACY IN THE UNITED STATES: CONTINUING A TRADITION THROUGH NEW INSTRUMENTS

The Beginnings of the Catholic Organ Legacy in the United States

To speak of the Catholic organ tradition in the United States as a "legacy" is no exaggeration as Catholic settlers from Europe were the first to bring the pipe organ to the Americas. By the sixteenth-century, Mexico was home to a number of music schools established by Spanish missionaries in an effort to teach indigenous people the ways of European liturgical music.[148] As part of their training, some were also taught the craft of organ building, and subsequent prohibitions of instruments other than the organ in church created a greater demand for new organs.[149] Organ historian Orpha Caroline Ochse notes how, true to their imperialistic aims, Spanish settlers gave the indigenous people the tasks of building and playing the instruments. She quotes one settler who reported that organs had been installed in all the churches of the area, and that "the Indians make the organs under our supervision, and they play the organs in our convents and monasteries."[150] From Mexico, the Spaniards established missions in areas that are now part of the United States; the organ built by Franciscan missionary Cristobal de Quiñones for mission San Felipe, in current-day New Mexico. The

---

[148] Ochse, Orpha Caroline. *The History of the Organ in the United States.* Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1988. 3.

[149] Ochse. 4.

[150] Ochse. 4.

Cristobal organ and other organs of surrounding missions were destroyed when the indigenous people rose in rebellion in 1680, burning the missions, and killing many of the Spaniards, expelling those who remained alive. When the Spaniards regained control of the missions in 1696, the churches were rebuilt, but they were no longer as wealthy as they had been, so the organs were never rebuilt.[151]

Besides the relatively short-lived vogue for Spanish style organs, other influences on organs in American Catholic churches came from England, such as the small English organ at the first cathedral of Baltimore, Maryland, mentioned in an earlier chapter (page 17), and later, from German Catholics who immigrated to the United States. One family of German organ builders, the Kilgens, became particularly successful in the United States. The Kilgen family purportedly traced its beginnings as organ builders to Sebastian Kilgen, a French Huguenot who fled France during religious persecutions, taking refuge in a German monastery near Durlach.[152] Here, it is said, he learned the art of organ building from the monks, and successive generations continued the organ building trade in Durlach. Two hundred years later, the family of organ builders moved to the United States, first to New York City in 1848, and later in 1873, to St. Louis, Missouri, where the company flourished for over eighty years.[153] The Kilgen Organ Company installed organs for a number of prominent Catholic churches, the most notable

---

[151] Ochse. 7.

[152] Ochse. 167.

[153] Barbara Owen, "Kilgen," *Grove Music Online*, *Oxford Music Online*, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/15003 (accessed October 9, 2010).

being the two organs at St. Patrick's Cathedral, New York City.[154] Both organs were commissioned by the organist and choirmaster at that time, the renowned Pietro Yon, and they were built according to his specifications between 1928-1930.[155] Work on the Chancel Organ began in 1928, and in1930 the Kilgen Company installed the Gallery Organ, consisting of 117 ranks in an intricately carved wooden case. The organ builders considered both organs to be one opus, calling the entire project Opus 5918.[156] The three-manual electro pneumatic Chancel Organ console and the four-manual electro-pneumatic Gallery Organ console were replaced in 1993 by the Turner Organ Company with two identical five-manual consoles capable of controlling both organs.[157] Apart from this and some other small additions, the Kilgen organs of St. Patrick's Cathedral continue, much as they have since their installation, the daily work of accompanying the Cathedral's vast number of Masses and liturgical services.

---

[154] Owen, "Kilgen."

[155] Saint Patrick's Cathedral. "Learn About the Organ at Saint Patrick's Cathedral," Saint Patrick's Cathedral Website, http://www.saintpatrickscathedral.org/organ-info-specifications.html (Accessed 1 October 2010).

[156] New York City American Guild of Organists, "Roman Catholic Cathedral of Saint Patrick, New York City," New York City American Guild of Organists Website, http://www.nycago.org/Organs/NYC/html/StPatrickCath.html#Kilgen1993 (Accessed 1 October 2010).

[157] "Roman Catholic Cathedral of Saint Patrick, New York City."

New Interest and Continuing Tradition: Recent Organ Installations

Perhaps one of the most vital ways the American Catholic organ tradition continues to exist and grow is through the construction and installation of new instruments in Catholic institutions. Recently, a number of prominent Catholic churches in the United States have taken on ambitious organ projects, resulting in a variety of instruments that reflect the changing needs of the Catholic liturgy as well as developing trends in organ building. A large number of these instruments are modeled after or inspired by great organs of Europe, particularly after those of seventeenth and eighteenth-century Germany and the Netherlands. At the same time, modern builders remain cognizant of the flexibility needed in contemporary Catholic liturgy and in music programs that feature a wide variety of musical repertoire, from Renaissance and Baroque music to music of the twenty-first-century. Builders like Paul Fritts have addressed this issue in various ways. Opus 24 at the University of Notre Dame, is a Baroque-inspired organ with modifications like a well-tempered tuning system that can accommodate a variety of repertoire, Fritts Opus 26 at Sacred Heart Cathedral, Rochester, New York, incorporates enclosed, expressive divisions into the primarily northern German scheme. Other builders, like Martin Pasi, accommodate diversity through the use of innovative measures alongside traditional methods, such as the dual-temperament Opus 14 of Saint Cecilia Cathedral, Omaha, Nebraska, or the soon-to-be-completed Opus 19 of Sacred Heart Co-Cathedral, Houston, Texas, which uses traditional suspended mechanical action along with a recently developed form of electric action that imitates the sensitivity of suspended action. Others,

such as the Nichols and Simpson Company, continue building in the classic "American" style, with the apse organ of Saint John the Evangelist Cathedral, Milwaukee. Dobson's Opus 75 at the recently-constructed Our Lady of the Angels Cathedral, Los Angeles, California, also adheres to this aesthetic of combining various styles of organ building into an instrument for greater flexibility. These two instruments also give examples of how two different builders address the issue of incorporating previously existing organs, whether it be through controlling new and old instruments from a single console or through incorporating ranks from an older instrument into a newer one. In all of these examples, we find ways in which American organ builders have created instruments to serve the Catholic liturgy while maintaining a high artistic value of their own, helping to insure that the organ remain prominent in Catholic churches throughout America.

Pasi Opus 14: Tradition and Creativity for an American Catholic Cathedral

One wonders if organ builders in seventeenth-century Protestant north-Germany, such as Arp Schnitger, would have ever imagined that three hundred years later, Catholics from the "New World" would be building instruments modeled after their own. Yet this is exactly what has happened in a number of prominent Catholic churches across the United States. St. Cecilia Cathedral in Omaha, Nebraska, represents one of the earliest examples in recent years where aspects of the seventeenth-century German aesthetic were applied to creating an instrument for modern worship. While the Paul Fritts organ at the University of Notre Dame, installed in 2004, just a year after the organ at Saint Cecilia

Cathedral is also modeled on north-German Baroque instruments, organ builder Martin Pasi took a different approach to incorporating early building methods to a modern instrument. The most striking difference about Pasi's instrument is his implementation of two temperaments Approximately half of the registers on the organ are in a circulating, well-tempered system, while the others are in quarter comma mean-tone tuning. Pasi drew his inspiration partly from the dual-temperament Fisk organ at Stanford University; however, the dual-temperament organ at St. Cecilia Cathedral was the first of its kind in an American Catholic church, allowing music of the Renaissance and early-Baroque eras to be played in the meantone temperament for which it was conceived, while also allowing later music with greater tonal range to be performed convincingly.[158] In this sense, the organ's two temperaments reflect the eclecticism of post-Vatican II Catholic liturgy.[159] The use of the dual temperament system along with a fairly large division for ten or more stops necessitated further creativity through the use of unusually large windchests.[160]

Kevin Vogt, the cathedral's director of music at the time and a chief advisor for the project, asserts that the positive reception of an organ such as Pasi Opus 14 by a congregation depends greatly on the artists one chooses to play the instrument for public concerts and recitals.[161]Vogt notes that he was careful to

[158] For a detailed specification see APPENDIX B.

[159] Vogt "The Embodiment of Harmony," 85.

[160] Vogt "The Embodiment of Harmony," 214.

[161] Vogt "The Embodiment of Harmony," 214.

invite concert organists who were comfortable with playing a wide variety of repertoire that could convincingly showcase both temperaments of the organ. Outside of concert use, Vogt shares the intriguing detail that during services, the organ's meantone capabilities have been used most often in a "liturgical context," while the well-tempered side is more often used for preludes and postludes that require a circulating temperament.[162] The dichotomy of temperament according to use raises some intriguing questions. Do the "pure" harmonies available in quarter comma meantone better compliment the nature of the Roman Catholic liturgy? Does this practice evoke nineteenth-century Cecilian ideals in which "older sounding" music is somehow more pure and worthy of the liturgy? By implication, one must also consider whether this connotes the use of a well-tempered system with music of a more secular or utilitarian function, such as a prelude or postlude, and whether prelude and postlude music should be considered outside the liturgical function or important components which "frame" liturgical ceremonies. Liturgical documents do no address temperament, and include very little about the function of prelude and postlude music, leaving much to the discretion of musicians and liturgists. For example, the United States Council of Catholic Bishops' document on music, *Sing to the Lord: Music in Divine Worship*, merely states that the organ may be used to play prelude and postlude music. It fails to provide any guidelines apart from general remarks about the nature of the organ itself, such its ability to give "resonance to the fullness of human sentiments, from joy to sadness, from praise to lamentation," or

[162] Vogt "The Embodiment of Harmony," 214.

that "the manifold possibilities of the organ in some way remind us of the immensity and magnificence of God."[163]

Despite the possible negative implications of a dual-temperament system on a Catholic music program, Vogt notes many positive effects of the Pasi organ, as parishioners sought to have a "music program at the cathedral that was comparable in stature to the new organ."[164] Since the organ's installation, the cathedral's "Saint Cecilia Schola Cantorum" came into being, including a choir school for children and an Institute of Sacred Music for adults who are current or aspiring Catholic music directors.[165] In this way, St. Cecilia Cathedral is a poignant example of how the installation of a new organ can transform the musical life of a parish and help to ensure that the tradition of organ in Catholic worship continues for future generations.

Vogt makes the astute observation that, besides having people to play the organ, organs require proper maintenance for their survival. This can at times be costly. Therefore, he asserts, the creation of financial endowments are essential to ensure that pipe organs can be maintained for years to come. Vogt elaborates:

> The unique opportunity to build an unusual organ such as Pasi Opus 14 is due in part to the funding coming from a single source and the organ builder being given the freedom to pursue an artistic vision. The maintenance of this work of art, however, becomes the responsibility of a community, and providing for this care is chief among the adjacent projects that now require development. An endowment will need to be raised not only to cover annual maintenance costs, but also to provide for

[163] United States Council of Catholic Bishops, *Sing to the Lord*, 13, 27.

[164] Vogt "The Embodiment of Harmony," 234.

[165] Vogt "The Embodiment of Harmony," 235.

> future maintenance needs, such as new bellows' leather in thirty or forty years.[166]

In light of these observations, key factors in the survival and success of an organ in a Catholic church, are the quality of the instrument, the musical education of parishioners, and possibly, students, and endowments to ensure the instrument's continued maintenance.

Fritts Opus 24 and Opus 26: the North-German ideal in Two Distinct Catholic Settings

Just one year after the installation of Martin Pasi's Opus 14 in Omaha's St. Cecilia Cathedral, another influential American organ builder, Paul Fritts, completed his Opus 26 for University of Notre Dame, in Notre Dame, Indiana, arguably the nation's most prominent Catholic educational institutions. As mentioned in the previous chapter, the Fritts organ at Notre Dame plays a central role in the university's sacred music program, and it resides in the Reyes Organ and Choral Hall, a facility specifically designed for the instrument with one-hundred seats and four seconds of reverberation.[167] The height of the room enables the organ to be placed in the hall's second-story gallery, with a *Rückpositive* division, which is located behind the back of the organist, nearest to the nave-like area of the hall where the audience is seated. While the organ serves a Catholic university, its design is in the style of the Schnitger organs of

[166] Vogt, "The Embodiment of Harmony," 239.

[167] James Hildreth, "The Fritts Organ, University of Notre Dame, *The American Organist* 42, no. 12 (Dec 2008): 97.

Protestant north-Germany, enabling the convincing performance of music by German baroque composers such as Dietrich Buxtehude, and Johann Sebastian Bach. It also accommodates music of successive centuries that does not require components such as enclosed divisions or registers voiced according to a symphonic aesthetic.[168]

The installation of the Fritts organ at Notre Dame has made the university a significant destination for organists and students. In 2005, the American Guild of Organists held their Pedagogy Conference at the Notre Dame, focusing on the music of Dietrich Buxtehude, with recitals given by a number of leading organists as well as lectures and workshops.[169] Events such as these underline the increasing diversity of musical activities in Catholic institutions. In the past, the absence of north-German-style organs in Catholic churches and schools would have made a conference on the music of Buxtehude impossible. In a sense, Fritts Opus 24 has allowed a prominent Catholic university to remain at the forefront of musical performance and scholarship in the United States. At the same time, the instrument's placement in a concert hall rather than a church limits its influence as a liturgical instrument. On the other hand, the concert hall setting of the instrument has the advantage of being free from the interruptions of multiple church services. As organists know all too well, some of the world's greatest

[168] For a detailed specification see APPPENDIX B

[169] Robert F Bates, Nancy J Cooper, John E Mitchener, Shelly Moorman-Stahlman, "The AGO National Pedagogy Conference 'Buxtehude on the Fritts' University of Notre Dame, September 11-14, 2005," *The American Organist* 40, no. 3 (March 2006): 73.

organs are difficult to access due to their placement in churches with multiple liturgical services and a high volume of visitors.

Another instrument by the same builder and also modeled on the north-German-style is the Fritts Opus 26 of Sacred Heart Cathedral, Rochester, New York. While Opus 24 at Notre Dame functions primarily as a concert and teaching instrument, Opus 26 exists as the principal instrument to accompany the cathedral's many liturgical services following an extensive renovation to the church building. Installed in 2008, Opus 26 features three manual division and pedal, but unlike Opus 24 at Notre Dame, it includes an enclosed Swell division, allowing the instrument greater versatility in performing a wide variety of organ repertoire.[170] The organ displays other juxtapositions of older methods of craftsmanship with modern-day technology, such as the use of suspended mechanical action and mechanical stop action along with an electric pre-set system, allowing organists to set and change their own registrations, a feature certainly not available on Baroque instruments.[171]

Bishop Matthew H. Clark, leader of the Catholic Diocese of Rochester acknowledged the impact that Sacred Heart Cathedral's new organ could have, not only for those who attend services at the cathedral, but for the larger musical

[170] For a detailed specification, see APPENDIX B

[171] Paul Fritts and Company Organbuilders, "Sacred Heart Cathedral, Rochester, New York," Paul Fritts and Company Organbuilders Website, http://www.frittsorgan.com/opus_pages/galleries/opus_26/specification.html (accessed 1 October 2010).

community of Rochester. During the organ's dedication ceremony, Bishop Clark explained:

> The organ, built so lovingly by Paul Fritts, is an important addition not only to the Cathedral, but our larger community, home to the Eastman School of Music and its well-regarded organ program and with which we have worked closely. As well, we hope it is a clear sign, along with other improvements here, of our investment in a city neighborhood we believe in, one that we hope the newly renovated Cathedral will help flourish.[172]

Bishop Clark's recognition of the organ program at the Eastman School of Music emphasizes an important relationship between the institutions. A few years earlier in 2005 the Eastman School of Music acquired a circa-1770 Italian-Baroque organ built by an anonymous builder, allowing listeners and performers to experience Italian organ repertoire of the seventeenth and eighteenth-centuries, such as the works of Girolamo Frescobaldi, in a way that more closely matches how the music was originally experienced.[173] The presence of this organ at Eastman and the Fritts organ at Sacred Heart Cathedral highlight the heavy cultural exchange that is characteristic of both the American pipe organ community and American Catholic church music. One cannot help but notice the somewhat ironic turn of events where a Catholic cathedral installs an organ in the style of organs that were characteristic of Lutheran churches in Germany, while a secular school of music acquires an organ typical of Catholic churches in Italy.

---

[172] The Cathedral Community at Sacred Heart Cathedral, "Halloran-All Saints Organ," The Cathedral Community at Sacred Heart Cathedral Website, http://www.cathedralcommunity.org/index.cfm/halloranall-saints-organ/ (Accessed 1 October 2010).

[173] Joel Speerstra, "Casparini in Rochester and Vilnius: A New Approach to Organ Restoration,"*The Tracker* 49, no. 3 (Summer 2005): 27.

Nonetheless, this crossover of national styles and mingling of Protestant and Catholic aesthetics embodies the diversity that is so intrinsic to the United States. The culture provides organists with opportunities to play instruments of different national styles, sometimes within the same city, a possibility that organists did not always have previously.

The Nichols and Simpson Organ of Saint John the Evangelist Cathedral, Milwaukee: A Reminder of a Divided Church

Just as organs can symbolize the growth and development of a church's music program, they can also be at the center of ecclesiastical controversy. Perhaps one of the most contentious organ projects in recent times is that of Saint John the Evangelist Cathedral in Milwaukee, Wisconsin. The organ project was part of a larger cathedral renovation project headed by then-Archbishop Rembert Weakland, OSB. Along with the removal of the original wooden pews and their subsequent replacement by moveable chairs, one of the most drastic changes in the cathedral project was the relocation of the choir from the rear gallery to the front of the sanctuary, in the space formerly occupied by the high altar and baldachin.[174] The high altar and baldachin, a canopy symbolizing the presence of the Holy Spirit during the Eucharistic liturgy, were removed, and the tabernacle containing the reserved Eucharist was moved from the center of the high altar to a side niche where the baptistery was formerly located. A modern disfigured Christ on the Cross hangs over the new altar which rests nearer to the center of the

[174] The Cathedral of St. John the Evangelist, "Organs of the Cathedral," The Cathedral of St. John the Evangelist Website, http://www.stjohncathedral.org/musicministry/mm-organs.htm (Accessed 1 October 2010).

church. The project drew heavy criticism from Catholics who felt that the building's historical and liturgical integrity was being violated, so much so that the Vatican, in an unusual act of mediation, asked for Archbishop Weakland to halt the project temporarily.[175] The Vatican was particularly concerned with the placement of the organ where the high altar used to be. Cardinal Jorge Medina Estévez, head of the Vatican's Congregation for Divine Worship, which oversees the various liturgical aspects of the Church at large and ensures that liturgical norms are followed, wrote Archbishop Weakland expressing concern over the proposed renovation, adding that the plans to place the organ in the sanctuary needed to be revised so as to "respect the hierarchical structure of the church of God that the cathedral by its scheme is to reflect."[176] Archbishop Weakland responded that he felt his plans followed liturgical directives, and following consultation with other ecclesiastics and canon lawyers, the Archbishop determined that he had the right to proceed as planned and finished the renovation in 2002.[177]

The Nichols and Simpson Company was selected to build the new organ of Saint John the Evangelist Cathedral, completing it in 2005. The existing 1966 Noehren organ was to remain in the cathedral's rear gallery; however, the new

---

[175] America Magazine. "Weakland Asked to Stop Cathedral Renovations," *America.* 184, no. 20 (April 2001), under "Signs of the Times," http://www.americamagazine.org/content/article.cfm?article_id=1762&s=2 (Accessed 1 October 2010).

[176] Gustav Niebuhr, "Milwaukee Cathedral Plan Draws Ecclesiastical Ire," *New York Times,* July 14, 2001, 8.

[177] Niebuhr, "Milwaukee Cathedral Plan Draws Ecclesiastical Ire."

placement of the choir and musicians in the sanctuary, along with the new Nichols-Simpson organ's placement in the apse, necessitated a new console that could control both organs.[178] The Nichols-Simpson instrument's specification reflects an eclectic style. Some stops, like the proposed 8' Harmonic Flute in the Solo division, are characteristic of the French symphonic organ tradition, while others such as the 8' Quintadena of the Swell division, evoke registers found on many German and Dutch organs of the seventeenth-century.[179] The console featuring four manuals and pedal contains stops for all the divisions of both the Noehren and Nichols-Simpson organs. With a number of stops in "preparation," not yet installed, including the entire Bombarde division, the cathedral's organ project still awaits final completion.

Dobson Opus 75: An Impressive Organ for a Progressive Church

In 2002, the same year Archbishop Weakland finished the renovation of Saint John the Evangelist Cathedral in Milwaukee, Cardinal Roger Mahoney, then-Cardinal-Archbishop of the Archdiocese of Los Angeles, California, dedicated the new Cathedral of Our Lady of the Angels. Like Archbishop Weakland's project, Cardinal Mahoney's proposed Cathedral raised a great deal of controversy among Catholics across the United States. In contrast to Archbishop Weakland's project which renovated an existing structure, Cardinal Mahoney's project entailed two controversial elements: the proposed demolition

[178] For a detailed specification, see APPENDIX B.

[179] Barbara Owen, *The Registration of Baroque Organ Music* (Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1999), 83.

of the original 1885 Saint Vibiana Cathedral and the erection of a new, massive edifice in downtown Los Angeles.[180] After Saint Vibiana Cathedral was severely damaged in the Northridge Earthquake of 1994 and deemed structurally unsound, the Archdiocese of Los Angeles sought to demolish the structure and construct a new building on the site. The plans were thwarted, however, when preservationists sued the archdiocese in an effort to prevent them from razing the nineteenth-century structure. The former cathedral was sold to a developer and now houses a center for the performing arts.[181]

Just as the former cathedral building was repurposed for a new use, so also was the former cathedral's organ. St. Vibiana's 1929 Wagnerin organ was rebuilt in 1988 by the Austin Organ Company, only several years before the destructive Northridge earthquake hit Los Angeles.[182] Fortunately, some of the pipework was salvageable and was incorporated into the Dobson organ for the new Our Lady of the Angels Cathedral. The Dobson Opus 75 instrument contains five divisions playable on four manuals, plus pedal, giving the organ the presence it needs to be heard in the massive nave, which seats up to 3,500 people.[183] The organ builders explain that the Solo and Pedal divisions are inspired by Isnard's 1772 Résonance

---

[180] Miles, Jack. "Our Lady of the Freeways." *Commonweal* 130, no. 4 (February 28, 2003): 16.

[181] "Cathedral Place St Vibiana's Cathedral." *Catholic New Times* 23, no. 28 (1999):2.

[182] Dobson Pipe Organ Builders, "Cathedral of Our Lady of the Angels, Los Angeles, California, Dobson Pipe Organ Builders, Ltd. Website, http://www.dobsonorgan.com/html/instruments/op75_losangeles.html (Accessed 2 October 2010).

[183] "Cathedral of Our Lady of the Angels, Los Angeles, California."

division of the Church of St. Maximin, in Saint-Maximin-la-Sainte-Baume in southern France. While the Great, Positive, Swell, and Fanfare divisions use slider chests with electric pull-downs, the Solo and Pedal divisions use electro-pneumatic action.[184] Along with the French-influenced Solo and Pedal divisions, the Fanfare division, composed entirely of horizontal chamade trumpets ranging from 16-foot to 4-foot pitches, pays homage to the eighteenth-century Spanish organ building tradition. In all, Dobson Opus 75 and the cathedral building represent a twenty-first-century translation of traditional ideals into a progressive church community.

Pasi Opus 19: a Contemporary Cathedral's Burgeoning Organ Tradition

The Martin Pasi Organ Builders of Ray, Washington, who installed the organ of Saint Cecilia Cathedral, Omaha, began the installation of a new pipe organ, Opus 19 at Sacred Heart Co-Cathedral in Houston, Texas in January of 2010.[185] The installation project was completed in October of 2010. The Galveston-Houston diocese is the largest Catholic diocese in Texas, with nearly 1.5 million registered Catholics, making it a significant presence in the American Catholic community.[186] Like the Cathedral of Our Lady of the Angels, Los Angeles, Sacred Heart Co-Cathedral is one of the United States' newest

[184] "Cathedral of Our Lady of the Angels, Los Angeles, California."

[185] For a detailed specification see APPENDIX B.

[186] "About Opus XIX," Co-Cathedral of the Sacred Heart Opus XIX Pipe Organ Site, http://sacredhearthouston.org/opus19/opus19.html (accessed 1 October 2010).

cathedrals, dedicated in 2008.[187] To date, this four-manual and pedal instrument is the largest built instrument built by the Pasi firm. Because of the instrument's size and the design of the organ case, which frames both sides of the twenty-two foot wide "resurrection window" in the rear gallery, the organ builders incorporated two different types of key-action. The first three divisions of the organ, the Great, the Positive, and the Swell, are closer to the console, and are controlled by suspended mechanical key-action, while the Pedal and Grand Choir divisions, which are on the opposite side of the window, use a recently developed system called "electric proportional key action."[188] Electric proportional key action is entirely electric with a sophisticated control in which magnets open and close the pallets in the wind chests imitating exactly the motion of the key. This design allows for the organist to have greater control of the pipe speech, even in the two most distant divisions, where the use of mechanical action would have been impractical.

In contrast to the Pasi Opus 14 organ in St. Cecilia's Omaha, which is primarily inspired by the north-German school of organ building, the specification of Pasi Opus 19 reflects several different influences. The sixteen-foot principal chorus in the Great division and characteristic full chorus of reed stops in the Pedal, ranging from a thirty-two foot Trombone to a two-foot Cornet, is inspired by the baroque instruments of northern Germany. This is placed alongside the

[187] "New Co-Cathedral Dedicated in Houston," *America* 198, no. 13 (April 21, 2008): 7. Academic Search Premier, EBSCOhost (accessed 8 October 2010).

[188] "Sacred Heart Co-Cathedral, Houston, Texas," Martin Pasi Organ Builders Website. http://www.pasiorgans.com/instruments/opus19about.html. (accessed 1 October 2010).

Grand Choir division, which the organ builders describe as being "modeled after the Resonance division in the famous Jean-Esprit Isnard organ at St. Maximin, Provence."[189] Interestingly, this organ also served as the model for the Solo and Pedal divisions of the Dobson Opus 75 instrument at Our Lady of the Angels Cathedral, however the Dobson firm and the Pasi firm have differing interpretations of the Isnard model. For example, although both builders opted for types of electric action, the Dobson firm chose standard electro-pneumatic action, and the Pasi firm electric proportional action. A comparison of the organs' specifications also highlights similarities and differences. Both instruments share a large number of manual stops with the pedal, and both builders include a thirty-two foot stop in the manual divisions that they modeled after the Isnard organ. The Dobson Opus 75 has a thirty-two foot Contra Bombarde, while Pasi Opus 19 uses a flue stop, a thirty-two foot Principal.[190] The different ways these two builders adapt aspects of the French model attest to the variety of building approaches that exist within American organ building. The eclectic yet historically informed approach is perhaps also indicative of current trends in American organ building, especially in Catholic Cathedrals with diverse liturgical needs.

[189] Martin Pasi Organ Builders, "Sacred Heart Co-Cathedral, Houston, Texas."

[190] See detailed specifications see APPPENDIX B.

The American Catholic Organ Building Continuum

Catholic churches in the United States have housed pipe organs from the time of the earliest Spanish missions and the earliest established Colonial parishes in Philadelphia to the present day.[191] Because of the value accorded to pipe organs by the American Catholic churches, the instruments represent both developments in organ building, and the gradual shifts of focus within Catholic liturgy, from a clerically-centered system to a more communal one. Perhaps this shift also explains the increased appearance of instruments based on models of organs from Protestant northern Germany and the Netherlands, regions with a strong congregational singing tradition dating back to the sixteenth-century.[192] The Fritts organs at the University of Notre Dame and Sacred Heart Cathedral, Rochester, are designed in the north German-Baroque style, as is the 1985 Taylor and Boody organ at the Catholic College of the Holy Cross, Worchester, Massachusetts.[193] By contrast, in searching for organs in American Catholic churches that are modeled nearly or completely on instruments from Catholic regions of Europe, one finds virtually no instruments modeled after the Baroque organs of Catholic European countries such as Italy, France, Austria, and Spain, apart from the

[191] Grimes, "John Aitken and Catholic Music in Federal Philadelphia," 290.

[192] Crist, Stephen A., "Early Lutheran Hymnals and Other Musical Sources in the Kessler Information Collection at Emory University," *Notes* 63, no. 3 (2007): 10. Academic Search Premier, EBSCOhost (accessed October 1, 2010).

[193] Taylor and Boody Organbuilders, "Holy Cross College, Worchester, MA," Taylor and Boody Organbuilders Website, http://www.taylorandboody.com/opus_pages/opus_09/specification.html. (accessed 19 August 2010).

inclusion of individual stops. One reason for this may be the modern Catholic liturgy and its need for instruments with a wide range of versatility to support congregation song and to perform organ literature that requires a powerful, independent pedal division, which historical organs in much of Catholic Europe do not have. For the Catholic Church of the United States, the pipe organ remains a servant of the liturgy – as the liturgy changes, so do the organs.

CHAPTER 7

"QUO VADIS?" THE FUTURE OF THE ORGAN IN AMERICAN CATHOLIC INSTITUTIONS

Questions on the Sustainability of the Organ as a Presence in Catholic Churches of the United States

The Catholic Church stands as a strong presence in the United States with some 67 million registered adherents as of 2009, making it the largest single denomination in the country.[194] Despite this figure, many challenges remain as American Catholics struggle to find their identity in the midst of rapid cultural secularization, along with fallout following the reforms of the Second Vatican Council. A recent poll by the Pew Research Center indicates that America's Catholics are not as young as they once were, with only eighteen percent of its demographic between the ages eighteen and twenty-nine.[195] In light of these figures, one of the greatest threats to the survival of the pipe organ in Catholic churches of the United States may not simply be American Catholics' attitude toward the use of the instrument, but, rather, a diminishing membership and subsequent difficulties maintaining and subsidizing facilities, or even church closures. Twenty-six percent of those surveyed from the "millennial" generation –

[194]" NCC's 2009 Yearbook of American & Canadian Churches Reports Decline in Catholic, Southern Baptist Membership," National Council of Churches Website, http://www.ncccusa.org/news/090130yearbook1.html

[195] The Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life, "Religion Among the Millennials: Less Religiously Active Than Older Americans, But Fairly Traditional In Other Ways," The Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life Website, http://pewforum.org/Age/Religion-Among-the-Millennials.aspx (accessed 19 August 2010).

born after 1981 – claimed no religious affiliation at all, representing an overall change in attitude in younger generations toward organized religion.[196] With an increased detachment from organized churches, including the Catholic Church, the long-term sustainability of the Catholic organ tradition, which is intimately tied to the celebration of the Church's liturgy, is called into question.

Glimmers of Hope? Pope Benedict XVI and his Impact on the Organ's Survival

Just as the era of the 1960's was a time of sweeping changes for liturgical music in the Catholic Church, subsequent years have proven themselves no less eventful in terms of music reform. One landmark event was the election as pope of Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger on April 19, 2005, who took the name Benedict XVI. The newly-elected pope was well-known by Catholics and non-Catholics alike as head of the Vatican's Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, known in earlier centuries as the Holy Inquisition.[197] Benedict became interested in classical music at an early age, and reportedly continued to play the piano in his free time even after his election to the papacy.[198] In his book *The Spirit of the Liturgy*, written five years before his election to the papacy, Ratzinger describes what he views as exemplary sacred music, "whether it is Bach or Mozart that we hear in church, we have a sense in either case of what Gloria Dei, the glory of God, means. The mystery of infinite beauty is there and enables us to experience

[196] "Religion Among the Millennials."

[197] Catholic University of America, *New Catholic Encyclopedia*, Vol. 4, (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1967), 944-945.

[198] David Gibson, *The Rule of Benedict: Pope Benedict XVI and His Battle with the Modern World* (San Francisco, California: Harper Collins Publishers 2006), 239.

the presence of God more truly and vividly than in many sermons."[199] This is a remarkable statement from a highly-educated and eloquent man who instructs that sacred music, at its best, not only enhances or decorates religious experience, but actually brings this experience about. He goes on, however, to caution against forms of music that do not evoke a sense of the sacred, "Not every kind of music can have a place in Christian worship…Does it integrate man by drawing him to what is above, or does it cause his disintegration into formless intoxication or mere sensuality?"[200] Already, Ratzinger distinguishes between types of music that are appropriate for the liturgy and those that are not. More specifically, he addresses current musical genres such as pop and rock, which greatly impacted liturgical music in the U.S. and beyond since the 1960's – and still do. He writes:

> On the one hand, there is pop music, which is certainly no longer supported by the people in the ancient sense (populus). It is aimed at the phenomenon of the masses, is industrially produced, and ultimately has to be described as a cult of the banal. "Rock," on the other hand, is the expression of elemental passions, and at rock festivals it assumes a cultic character, a form of worship, in fact, in opposition to Christian worship. People are, so to speak, released from themselves by the experience of being part of a crowd and by the emotional shock of rhythm, noise, and special lighting effects…The music of the Holy Spirit's sober inebriation seems to have little chance when self has become a prison, the mind is a shackle, and breaking out from both appears as a true promise of redemption that can be tasted at least for a few moments.[201]

[199] Ratzinger, *The Spirit of the Liturgy*, 148

[200] Ratzinger, *The Spirit of the Liturgy*, 151

[201] Ratzinger, *The Spirit of the Liturgy*, 148

Ratzinger's view is clear: secular music forms are not just undesirable in the liturgy, but they work against the aesthetic of liturgy, a model of order, ascendency and simplicity.

As Pope Benedict XVI, Joseph Ratzinger's views on liturgy and sacred music took on a much stronger influence. Regarding the use of the pipe organ in the Catholic liturgy, Benedict echoes the praise given in the instrument in the Second Vatican Council's *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy*. During a blessing of the newly-restored organ of the Collegiate Basilica Church of Our Lady, commonly known as the Alte Kapelle, in Regensburg, Germany, Pope Benedict described the pipe organ in general as "transcending the merely human sphere, as all music of quality does, evokes the divine. ... It is capable of echoing and expressing all the experiences of human life. The manifold possibilities of the organ in some way remind us of the immensity and the magnificence of God."[202] Here, Benedict makes the connection between his earlier statements about sacred music and the pipe organ, classifying the pipe organ as an instrument that is an asset to the liturgy and a reflection of the divine. The Pope goes to make the analogy between an organist's skill and the diversity of the Church's members:

> Just as in an organ an expert hand must constantly bring disharmony back to consonance, so we in the Church, in the variety of our gifts and charisms, always need to find anew, through our communion in faith, harmony in the praise of God and in fraternal love.[203]

---

[202] Pope Benedict XVI, "The Last Page: Address of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI at the Blessing of the New Organ in the Alte Kapelle at Regensburg," *The American Organist* 40, no. 12 (December 2006): 112.

[203] Benedict XVI, "Address of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI at the Blessing of the New Organ in the Alte Kapelle at Regensburg," 112.

The pope's analogy using "harmony" and "dissonance" also reinforces the concept that liturgy, with its music, ideally conveys a sense of order, and a continual sense of self-transformation. The pope concluded his speech with a blessing, wishing that "all those who enter this splendid Basilica, experiencing the magnificence of its architecture and its liturgy, enriched by solemn song and the harmony of this new organ, be brought to the joy of faith."[204]

With the papacy of Pope Benedict XVI has come a number of liturgical reform movements in the Catholic Church of the U.S., advocating high-quality liturgical music, including an increased use of the pipe organ in the liturgy. Other movements, already well in place before Benedict assumed the papal office, gained greater impetus with Benedict's ascendance to the Holy See. Other popes since Vatican II have also reaffirmed the importance of the organ as one of primary sources of music for the Catholic liturgy, though perhaps not in such an unequivocal way Benedict XVI. Pope John Paul II in an address to the International Congress of Sacred Music in 2001 asked that music students use their talents for "Gregorian chant, sacred polyphony, and the organ."[205] While conceding that other instruments and forms of music were permitted, Pope John Paul II stated that the three principal forms of Catholic liturgical music should be used and reverenced whenever possible, adding, "only in this way will liturgical

[204] Benedict XVI, "Address of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI at the Blessing of the New Organ in the Alte Kapelle at Regensburg," 112.

[205] Elizabeth-Jane Pavlick." John Paul II's Statements on Music in the Church: A Fulfillment of the Theology of Vatican II. *Sacred Music* 137, no. 1 (Spring 2010): 15. ProQuest Direct Complete (accessed 2 September 2010).

music worthily fulfill its function during the celebration of the sacraments, and, especially, of Holy Mass."[206] Later in the address, the pope asked organists to explore music that incorporates other instruments, so that "these riches will help the Church at prayer, so that the symphony of her praise may be attuned to the 'diapason' of Christ the Savior."[207] It should be noted that while Pope John Paul II called for open-mindedness toward the incorporation of musical instruments and styles, he did not indicate that the organ should take a place in the background of the Catholic liturgy.

Conclusion

For the Catholic Church of the United States, the continued use of the pipe organ depends much on the state of the liturgy, and at a more basic level, its continued celebration by American Catholics. Another consideration is the changing face of American Catholicism, as younger generations appear less interested in organized religion.[208] Liturgical music will doubtless be affected as the Catholic Church in America becomes less Euro-centric, particularly with the large influx of Catholic immigrants from Latin America.[209] Liturgical music scholar and Benedictine monk Anthony Ruff notes that some liturgical commentators see the bias for the pipe organ in the *Constitution on the Liturgy* as

[206] Pavlick, "John Paul II's Statements on Music in the Church," 15.

[207] Pavlick, "John Paul II's Statements on Music in the Church," 17.

[208] Pew Forum, "Religion Among the Millennials."

[209] Joseph Claude Harris, "The Future Church," *America* 186, no. 9 (March 18, 2002): 9. *Academic Search Premier*, EBSCO*host* (accessed October 1, 2010).

purely Western.[210] While this is difficult to deny, it is also difficult to deny that the Roman Catholic Church and its liturgy are inextricably tied to Europe, the land of its birth and development.

Despite many uncertainties, the pipe organ continues to hold the interest of some Catholic Americans, from traditionalist Catholics, who seek to preserve the pre-Conciliar liturgy and its music, to conservative Catholics, inspired by the efforts of Pope Benedict XVI, to some moderate and progressive Catholics who continue to use the organ as a tool for active participation in the liturgy. A number of Catholic sacred music programs emphasizing the importance of the organ in the liturgy continue to exist in some Catholic universities, along with the creation of several new programs. Along with these, perhaps the most enduring factor that will contribute to the organ's survival in Catholic America, are the incredible instruments that exist in a large number of prominent Catholic churches, including many instruments installed in recent times. All of these factors offer hope for the continued presence of the king of instruments in American Catholicism, continuing a legacy of timeless music in the midst of an ever-changing world.

[210] Ruff, *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform*, 324-325.

REFERENCES

Articles

America Magazine. "Musicians, People in Pews Differ on Helps for Singing," *America* 196, no. 3 (January 29, 2007): 6. Academic Search Premier, EBSCOhost (accessed 5 September 2010).

"New Co-Cathedral Dedicated in Houston." *America* 198, no. 13 (April 21, 2008): 7. Academic Search Premier, EBSCOhost (accessed 8 October 2010).

"Reaching Right," *America* 200, no. 6 (February 23, 2009): 5, *Academic Search Premier*, EBSCO*host* (accessed 2 October 2010).

"Weakland Asked to Stop Cathedral Renovations," *America.* 184, no. 20 (April 2001), *Academic Search Premier*, EBSCO*host* (accessed 1 October 2010).

Bates, Robert F, Nancy J Cooper, John E Mitchener, and Shelly Moorman-Stahlman. "The AGO National Pedagogy Conference 'Buxtehude on the Fritts' University of Notre Dame, September 11-14, 2005." *The American Organist* 40, no. 3 (March 2006): 73.

Benedict XVI, Pope. Pope Benedict XVI. "The Last Page: Address of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI at the Blessing of the New Organ in the Alte Kapelle at Regensburg." *The American Organist* 40, no. 12 (December 2006): 112.

"Letter Of His Holiness Benedict XVI To The Bishops On The Occasion Of The Publication Of The Apostolic Letter 'Motu Proprio Data' *Summorum Pontificum* On The Use Of The Roman Liturgy Prior To The Reform Of 1970." *Sacred Music* 134, no. 3 (Fall 2007): 46-48.

"Summorum Pontificum." *Sacred Music* 134, no. 3 (Fall 2007): 49. ProQuest Direct Complete (accessed 11 October 2010).

Brancaleone, Francis. "Justine Ward and the Fostering of an American Solesmes Chant Tradition." *Sacred Music* 136, no. 3 (Fall 2009); 6-26.

Cones, Bryan. "Who are the Lefebvrites, and are they Catholic?." U.S. Catholic 74, no. 4 (April 2009): 41, Academic Search Premier, EBSCOhost (accessed 1 October 2010).

Crist, Stephen A. "Early Lutheran Hymnals and Other Musical Sources in the Kessler Reformation Collection at Emory University." Notes 63, no. 3 (March 2007): 503-532. Academic Search Premier, EBSCOhost (accessed October 8, 2010).

Cunningham, W. Pat, and Carolyn Cunningham. "Sacred Music Colloquium 2009." *Sacred Music* 136, no. 3 (Fall 2009): 67. ProQuest Direct Complete (accessed 4 September 2010).

Grimes, Robert R. "John Aitken and Catholic Music in Federal Philadelphia." *American Music* 16, no. 3 (Autumn 1998): 289-310.

Harrison, O.S. Brian W. "The Postconcilar Eucharistic Liturgy: Planning a 'Reform of the Reform,'" *The Reform of the Reform? A Liturgical Debate: Reform or Return*. Thomas M. Kocik, ed. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 2003.

James Hildreth. "The Fritts Organ, University of Notre Dame. *The American Organist* 42, no. 12 (Dec 2008): 97.

Harris, Joseph Claude. "The Future Church." *America* 186, no. 9 (March 18, 2002): 9. *Academic Search Premier*, EBSCO*host* (accessed October 1, 2010).

Hytrek, Theophane, O.S.F. "Facing Reality in the Liturgical Music Apostolate," in *Crisis in Church Music?* Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference, 1967.

Joncas, Jan Michael. "Liturgical Music as Music: The Contribution of the Human Sciences." *Liturgy and Music: Lifetime Learning*. Leaver, A. Robin and Joyce Ann Zimmerman, eds. Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press. 1998. 220-230.

Jones, Arthur. "Struggling to catch the beat." *National Catholic Reporter* 37, no. 37 (August 24, 2001): 3. *Academic Search Premier*, EBSCO*host* (accessed 1 October 2010).

Kelly, F. Joseph. "Sacred Music and the University." *The Ecclesiastical Review* 64, (January 1921): 527-530.

"Latin Mass: Two-thirds of Catholics have no opinion." *National Catholic Reporter* 45, no. 23 (September 4, 2009): 4, *Academic Search Premier*, EBSCO*host* (accessed 1 October 2010).

Latona, Peter, Robert Grogan, Geraldine M Rohling. “The Basilica of the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception: Upper Church Organ Renovation Project.” *The Diapason* 93, no. 3 (March 2002): 21-23.

Miles, Jack. "Our Lady of the Freeways." *Commonweal* 130, no. 4 (February 28, 2003): 13-17. Academic Search Premier, EBSCOhost (accessed 8 October 2010).

Moleck, Fred. “Sacred Music at Duquesne.” *Pastoral Music* 21, no. 2 (December-January 1997): 49.

Owen, Barbara. "Kilgen." *In Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online.* http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/15003 (accessed 1 October 2010).

Elizabeth-Jane Pavlick.” John Paul II's Statements on Music in the Church: A Fulfillment of the Theology of Vatican II. *Sacred Music* 137, no. 1 (Spring 2010): 15. ProQuest Direct Complete (accessed 2 September 2010).

Pius X, Pope. “Moto Proprio---Tra Le Sollecitudini (Sections II, III, IV).” *Sacred Music* 131, no. 1 (Spring 2004): 7-9.

“Moto Proprio---Tra Le Sollecitudini (Sections V-IX).” *Sacred Music* 131, no. 2 (Summer 2004): 7-9.

Quinn, Frank C., O.P. “Problems of Hymnody in Catholic Worship.” *Liturgy and Music: Lifetime Learning.* Leaver, A. Robin and Joyce Ann Zimmerman, eds. Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press. 1998. 308-323.

Ratzinger, Josef Cardinal and Pope Benedict XVI. “Theological Problems of Church Music” in *Sacred Music* 135, no. 1 (Spring 2008), 5-14.

Sacred Congregation of Rites, The. “Musicam Sacram.” *Vatican Council II: The Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents.* Austin Flannery, OP, ed. Northport, New York: Costello Publishing Company, 1975. 80-97.

Schuller, Richard J. “From the Editors: Welcome to Adoremus,” *Sacred Music* 122, no. 3 (Fall 1995); 4-5.

Speerstra, Joel. “Casparini in Rochester and Vilnius: A New Approach to Organ Restoration.”*The Tracker* 49, no. 3 (Summer 2005): 27.

Weakland, Rembert, O.S.B. "Music and Liturgy in Evolution," in *Crisis in Church Music?* Washington, D.C.: The Liturgical Conference. 1967.

Wyatt, Dan. "Pastoral Musicians: Certified or Certifiable." *Pastoral Music* 33, no. 1 (October 2008); 66.

Books:

America, Catholic University of. *The New Catholic Encyclopedia*. Vol. 4. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1967.

Blackwell, Albert L. *The Sacred in Music*. Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 2000.

Boccardi, Donald. *History of American Catholic Hymnals: Since Vatican II*. Chicago: GIA Publications, 2001.

Burton, Katherine. *The Great Mantle: The Life of Giuseppe Melchiore Sarto Pope Pius X*. New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1950.

Carroll, Catherine A. *A History of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music: 1916-1969*. St. Louis: Society of the Sacred Heart, 1989.

Combe, Pierre. *Justine Ward and Solesmes*. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1987.

The Restoration of Gregorian Chant: Solesmes and the Vatican Edition. Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press, 2003.

Foley, Edward, and Mark Paul Bangert. *Worship Music: A Concise Dictionary.* Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 2000.

Gibson, David. *The Rule of Benedict: Pope Benedict XVI and His Battle with the Modern World*. San Francisco, California: Harper Collins Publishers, 2006.

Hebblethwaite, Peter. *Pope John XXIII: Shepherd of the Modern World*. Garden City, New York: Doubleday & Company, Inc., 1985.

Hebermann, Charles, Edward A. Pace, Condé B. Pallen, Thomas J. Shahan, John J. Wynne, eds. *The Catholic Encyclopedia: An International Work of Reference on the Constitution, Doctrine, Discipline, and History of the Catholic Church*. Vol. 10. New York: The Encyclopedia Press, 1913.

Hume, Paul. *Catholic Church Music.* New York: Dodd, Mean and Co., 1957.

Lysik, David, ed. *The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource* (Chicago: Liturgy Training Publications, 1991).

Kocik, Thomas M. *Reform of the Reform? A Liturgical Debate: Reform or Return.* San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 2003.

Leaver, Robin A., and Joyce Ann Zimmerman, eds. *Liturgy and Music: Lifetime Learning.* Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1998.

The Missionary Society of Saint Paul the Apostle in the State of New York. *The Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy of the Second Vatican Council and the Motu Proprio of Pope Paul VI.* Glen Rock, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1964.

Ochse, Orpha Caroline. *The History of the Organ in the United States.* Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1988.

Owen, Barbara. *The Registration of Baroque Organ Music*. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1999.

Pecklers, Keith F. *The Unread Vision: the Liturgical Movement in the United States of America*. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1998.

Ratzinger, Joseph Cardinal, and Pope Benedict XVI. *The Spirit of the Liturgy*. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 2000.

Rossini, Carlo, ed. *The Liturgical Organist, Volume 1: Easy Compositions -- Preludes, Interludes & Postludes for Pipe or Reed Organ.* New York: J. Fischer & Bro., 1937.

Ruff, Anthony, OSB. *Sacred Music and Liturgical Reform: Treasures and Transformations.* Hillenbrand Books: Chicago, 2007.

Schaefer, Edward E. *Catholic Music Through the Ages: Balancing the Needs of a Worshipping Church*. Chicago, IL: Hillenbrand Books, 2008.

Tucker, Jeffery A. *Sing Like a Catholic.* Richmond, VA: Church Music Association of America, 2009.

United States Council of Catholic Bishops, The. *Sing to the Lord: Music in Divine Worship.* Washington, D.C.: United Stated Council of Catholic Bishops, 2007.

Dissertations and Theses

Huck, Marianna, CSJ. "The Role of the Pius X School of Music in the Liturgical Movement." Master's thesis. Catholic University of America, Washington DC: 1965.

Scraper, Joel F. "Josef Gabriel Rheinberger and the Regensburg Cecilian movement." DMA Diss., University of Missouri, Kansas City, MO, 2006.

Unpublished Works

Vogt, Kevin Christopher. *The Embodiment of Harmony: A History of the Organs in the Roman Catholic Cathedrals of Omaha Culminating in an Organ by Martin Pasi with Two Temperaments*. Http://www.pasiorgans.com/conference/harmony.html (accessed 2 September 2010).

Web Sites

Ave Maria University, "AMU Celebrates Feast of the Annunciation With New Award, State of the Art Organ, Exterior Lights and More," Ave Maria University website, http://www.avemaria.edu/news/248.html. (accessed 31 August 2010).

The Cathedral Community at Sacred Heart Cathedral. "Halloran-All Saints Organ." The Cathedral Community at Sacred Heart Cathedral Website. http://www.cathedralcommunity.org/index.cfm/halloranall-saints-organ/ (accessed 1 October 2010).

Cathedral of St. John the Evangelist, The. "Organs of the Cathedral." The Cathedral of St. John the Evangelist Website. http://www.stjohncathedral.org/musicministry/mm-organs.htm (accessed 1 October 2010).

Catholic University of America. "Schudi Organ," Catholic University of America, Sacred Music Website, http://sacredmusic.cua.edu/SchudiOrgan.cfm (accessed 31 August 2010).

"Who We Are," Catholic University of America, Sacred Music Website. http://sacredmusic.cua.edu/Who-We-Are.cfm (accessed 31 August 2010).

Church Music Association of America, The. "Supporting Sacred Music," The Church Music Association of America Website, http://www.musicasacra.com/ (accessed 13 September 2010).

Dobson Pipe Organ Builders."Cathedral of Our Lady of the Angels, Los Angeles, California. Dobson Pipe Organ Builders, Ltd. Website. http://www.dobsonorgan.com/html/instruments/op75_losangeles.html (accessed 2 October 2010).

Manhattanville College. "History." Manhattanville College Website. http://www.manhattanville.edu/AboutManhattanville/History/Default.aspx. (accessed 16 August 2010).

"Requirements," Manhattanville College, Music Department Website. http://www.manhattanville.edu/AcademicsandResearch/AcademicDepartments/Music/Requirements.aspx (accessed 16 August 2010).

National Association of Pastoral Musicians. "NPM Mission Statement," National Association of Pastoral Musicians Website. http://www.npm.org/presence/mission.htm (accessed 2 September 2010).

National Council of Churches, The. "Catholics, Mormons, Assemblies of God growing; Mainline churches report a continuing decline" from National Council of Churches" Website. http://www.ncccusa.org/news/100204yearbook2010.html (accessed 4 September 2010).

New York Chapter American Guild of Organists. "Roman Catholic Cathedral of Saint Patrick, New York City." New York Chapter American Guild of Organists Website. http://www.nycago.org/Organs/NYC/html/StPatrickCath.html#Kilgen5918 (accessed 7 September 2010).

Paul Fritts and Company Organbuilders. "Sacred Heart Cathedral, Rochester, New York." Paul Fritts and Company Organbuilders Website. http://www.frittsorgan.com/opus_pages/galleries/opus_26/specification.html (accessed 1 October 2010).

Pius XI, Pope. "Divini Cultis Sanctitatem." Official Website of the Vatican. http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/pius_xi/apost_constitutions/documents/hf_p-xi_apc_19281220_divini-cultus-sanctitatem_lt.html (accessed 9 September 2010).

Saint John's University. "Program Outcomes, M.A. in Liturgical Music." Saint John's School of Theology Website. http://www1.csbsju.edu/sot/academicprograms/degree_MaLiturgicalMusic_outcomes.htm (accessed 31 August 2010).

Saint Patrick's Cathedral. "Learn About the Organ at Saint Patrick's Cathedral." Saint Patrick's Cathedral Website. http://www.saintpatrickscathedral.org/organ-info-specifications.html (accessed 1 October 2010).

Taylor and Boody Organbuilders. "Holy Cross College, Worchester, MA." Taylor and Boody Organbuilders Website. http://www.taylorandboody.com/opus_pages/opus_09/specification.html. (accessed 19 August 2010).

University of Notre Dame, The. "Master of Sacred Music, Program of Study." University of Notre Dame, Department of Theology Website. http://theology.nd.edu/graduate-program/master-of-sacred-music/program/ (accessed 16 August 2010).

APPENDIX A

LITURGICAL DOCUMENTS SUPPORTING THE USE OF THE ORGAN IN CATHOLIC LITURGY

Vatican Council Documents

Second Vatican Council, The. "Sacrosanctum Concilium, the Constituion on the Sacred Liturgy." *The Liturgy Documents: A Parish Resource.* David Lysik, ed. Chicago: Liturgy Training Publications, 1991.

Official Vatican Instructions

Sacred Congregation of Rites, The. "Musicam Sacram." *Vatican Council II: The Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents.* Austin Flannery, OP, ed. Northport, New York: Costello Publishing Company, 1975. 80-97.

Papal Documents

Pius X, Pope. "Moto Proprio---Tra Le Sollecitudini (Sections II, III, IV)." *Sacred Music* 131, no. 1 (Spring 2004): 7-9.

"Moto Proprio---Tra Le Sollecitudini (Sections V-IX)." *Sacred Music* 131, no. 2 (Summer 2004): 7-9.

Pius XI, Pope. "Divini Cultis Sanctitatem." Official Website of the Vatican. http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/pius_xi/apost_constitutions/documents/hf_p-xi_apc_19281220_divini-cultus-sanctitatem_lt.html (accessed 9 September 2010).

Papal Speeches

Benedict XVI, Pope. Pope Benedict XVI. "The Last Page: Address of His Holiness Pope Benedict XVI at the Blessing of the New Organ in the Alte Kapelle at Regensburg." *The American Organist* 40, no. 12 (December 2006): 112.

Elizabeth-Jane Pavlick." John Paul II's Statements on Music in the Church: A Fulfillment of the Theology of Vatican II. *Sacred Music* 137, no. 1 (Spring 2010): 15.

American Bishops

United States Council of Catholic Bishops. *Sing to the Lord: Music in Divine Worship.* Washington, D.C.: 2007.

APPENDIX B

SELECTED ORGAN SPECIFICATIONS

1. Saint Cecilia Cathedral, Omaha, Nebraska.
Pasi Organ Builders, Opus 14, 2003.
Three manuals and pedal, 55-stops, 29-stops available in quarter comma meantone and a well-tempered system by Kristian Wegscheider. [211]

I. Hauptwerk	*II. Oberwerk*	*III. Unterwerk (encl.)*	*IV. Pedal*
16’ Praestant *	8’ Principal *	16’ Bourdon	32’ Subbass
8’ Octave *	8’ Suavial (discant) *	8’ Principal	16’ Principal *
8’ Salicional	8’ Gedeckt *	8’ Gamba	16’ Subbass (octave transmission)
8’ Rohrflöte *	4’ Octave *	8’ Celeste	8’ Octave (octave transmission) *
4’ Octave *	4’ Rohrflöte *	8’ Harmonic Flute	8’ Bourdon
4’ Spitzflöte	2 2/3’ Sesquialtera II *	4’ Principal	4’ Octave *
2 2/3’ Quinte *	2’ Octave *	4’ Harmonic Flute	2 2/3’ Mixture V *
2’ Superoctave *	2’ Waldflöte *	2 2/3’ Nazard	32’ Trombone
1 1/3’ Mixture V *	1 1/3’ Quinte *	2’ Octavin	16’ Posaune (octave transmission) *
1’ Mixture IV	1’ Mixture IV	1 3/5’ Tierce	8’ Trumpet *
8’ Cornet V (discant)	16’ Dulzian	2’ Mixture V	8’ Trompette
16’ Trumpet *	8’ Trichterregal *	16’ Bassoon	4’ Clairon
8’ Trumpet *	----------	8’ Trompette	2’ Cornet *
8’ Trompette	----------	8’ Oboe	----------
8’ Vox Humana *	----------	4’ Clairon	----------

(*) Indicates register available in quarter comma meantone temperament.
Accessories: Tremulant, Zimbelstern, Rossignol, Normal Couplers, 12 General Combinations, Sequencer, 96 Levels of Memory, and Flat Pedalboard.

[211] Vogt, *The Embodiment of Harmony*, 253.

2. Sacred Heart Co-Cathedral, Houston, Texas.
Martin Pasi Organ Builders. Opus 19, 2010.
Four manuals and pedal, 75-stops in "Mark Brombaugh Mild," an unequal but well-tempered tuning system.[212]

I. Grand Choir	*II. Great*	*III. Positive*
32' Principal	16' Principal	16' Quintadena
16' Praestant	8' Octave	8' Principal
16' Violone	8' Spitzfloete	8' Gedackt
16' Bourdon	8' Harmonic Flute	8' Salicional
8' Octave	8' Gamba	8' Suavial (g)
8' Flute	6' Quinte	4' Octave
4' Octave	4' Octave	4' Rohrfloete
3' Plein Jeu VII+	4' Nachthorn	3' Nazard
16' Posaune	3' Quinte	3' Sesquialtera II
16' Bombarde	2' Octave	2' Octave
8' Trompette	1 3/5' Terz	2' Gemshorn
8' Trumpet	8' Cornet V c1	1 3/5' Tierce
8' Clarinette	2' Mixture V	1 1/3' Larigot
4' Schalmay	3' Rauschpfeife IV	1' Scharff IV
8' Trompeta	16' Trumpet	16' Dulcian
4'-16' Trompeta	8' Trumpet	8' Cromorne
----------	8' Trompette	8' Trumpet
----------	4' Clairon	8' Trechterregal

IV. Swell	*V. Pedal*
16' Bourdon	32' Principal
8' Principal	16' Praestant
8' Viole de Gambe	16' Violone
8' Celeste	16' Bourdon
8' Rohrfloete	8' Octave
4' Octave	8' Flute
4' Harmonic Flute	4' Octave
4' Violetta	3' Mixtur V†
3 1/5' Gross Tierce	32' Bombarde†
3' Nazard	32' Trombone†
2' Octave	16' Posaune
2' Octavin	16' Bombarde
1 3/5' Tierce	8' Trompette
1' Flageolet	8' Trumpet

[212] Pasi Organ Builders, "About Opus 19," Pasi Organ Builders Website, http://www.pasiorgans.com/instruments/opus19about.html (accessed 29 September 2010).

2' Mixture V	8' Clarinette
16' Bassoon	4' Schalmay
8' Trompette	2' Cornet†
8' Oboe	8' Trompeta
4' Clairon	----------
8' Voix Humaine	----------

Accessories: One Positive and Great tremulant, two Swell tremulants, Zimbelstern, normal couplers, octave graves couplers.
(†) Indicates independent pedal stop not borrowed from other divisions.

3. University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, Indiana.
Paul Fritts and Company Organ Builders, Opus 24, 2004.
Two-manuals and pedal, 34-stops in modified Kirnberger temperament.[213]

I. Hauptwerk	*II. Rückpositive*	*III. Pedal*
16' Principal	8' Principal	16' Principal†
8' Octave	8' Gedackt	8' Octave
8' Rohrflöte	8' Quintadena	4' Octave
8' Violdigamba	4' Octave	2' Nachthorn
4' Octave	4' Rohrflöte	Mixture VI
4' Spitzflöte	2' Octave	16' Posaune
3' Quint	2' Waldflöte	8' Trompet
Nasat/Cornet III	1 1/3' Quinte	4' Trompet
2' Octave	Quint/Sesquiltara II	2' Cornet
Mixture IV-VI	Scharff III-V	----------
16' Trompet	16' Fagott	----------
8' Trompet	8' Trichterregal	----------
8' Baarpfeife	4' Schalmey	----------

Accessories: Rückpositive to Hauptwerk coupler, Hauptwerk to Pedal coupler, Rückpositive to Pedal coupler, variable tremulant (whole organ), wind stabilizer.
(†) Indicates that some pipes may be transmitted from other stops.

[213] Paul Fritts and Company Organ Builders, "University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, Indiana," Paul Fritts and Company Organ Builders Website, http://www.frittsorgan.com/opus_pages/galleries/opus_24/specification.html

4. Cathedral of Our Lady of the Angels, Los Angeles, California.
Dobson Pipe Organ Builders, Opus 75, 2003.
Four Manuals and pedal, 76-stops in equal temperament. [214]

I. Great	*II. Positive*	*III. Swell*
32' Prestant	16' Gemshorn	16' Bourdon
16' Prestant	8' Principal	8' Diapason
16' Violonbasse	8' Gedackt	8' Bourdon
16' Bourdon	8' Salicional	8' Viole de gambe
8' Principal	8' Unda maris CC	8' Voix céleste CC
8' Violoncelle	4' Octave	8' Dulciane
8' Flûte harmonique	4' Chimney Flute	8' Voix angélique TC
8' Doppel Floete	2' Octave	4' Prestant
5-1/3' Gros Nasard	1-1/3' Larigot	4' Flûte octaviante
4' Octave	II Sesquialtera 2-2/3'	2-2/3' Nasard
4' Nachthorn	IV-VI Mixture 1-1/3'	2' Octavin
3-1/5' Grosse Tierce	8' Trumpet	1-3/5' Tierce
2-2/3' Quinte	4' Clarion	V Plein jeu 2'
2' Octave	8' Cromorne	16' Bombarde
1-3/5' Tierce	8' Harp	8' Trompette harmonique
V-VII Corneta Magna 8' (f18-g56)	8’ Tuba (Solo)	8' Hautbois
V-VIII Mixture 2'	----------	8' Voix humaine
IV Cymbale 1'	----------	4' Clairon harmonique
16' Posaune	----------	Chimes

[214] Dobson Pipe Organ Builders, “Cathedral of Our Lady of the Angels, Los Angeles,” Dobson Pipe Organ Builders Website, http://www.dobsonorgan.com/html/instruments/op75_losangeles.html (accessed 2 October 2010).

8' Trumpet	----------	----------
4' Clarion	----------	----------
8' Horizontal Trumpet	----------	----------

IV. Solo	*V. Fanfare (floating)*	*VI. Pedal*
16' Principal	16' Trompeta magna	32' Prestant (Great)
8' Principal	8' Trompeta de los angeles	32' Contra Bourdon
8' Major Flute	8' Trompeta fuerte (ext. 4')	16' Open Diapason
8' Gamba	8' Clarín de campaña (ext. 16')	16' Principal (Solo)
8' Gamba Celeste CC	4' Bajoncillo	16' Violonbasse (Great)
8' Viole d'orchestre	----------	16' Subbass (ext. 32')
8' Viole Celeste TC	----------	16' Bourdon (Great)
5-1/3' Quinte	----------	16' Gemshorn (Positive)
4' Octave	----------	10-2/3' Gross Quint (ext. Open Diapason
4' Orchestral Flute	----------	8' Principal (Solo)
IV Mixture 2-2/3'	----------	8' Flute (ext. Open Diapason)
8' English Horn	----------	8' Violoncelle (Great)
8' French Horn	----------	8' Bourdon (ext. 32')
8' Clarinet	----------	5-1/3' Quint (Solo)
32' Contre Bombarde (ext. 16')	----------	4' Octave (Solo)
16' Bombarde	----------	IV Mixture 2-2/3' (Solo)
8' Trumpet	----------	32' Contra Trombone
4' Clarion	----------	32' Contre Bombarde (Solo)
8' Tuba	----------	16' Trombone (ext. 32')
8' Horizontal Trumpet (Great)	----------	16' Bombarde (Solo)
----------	----------	16' Posaune (Great)
----------	----------	8' Trumpet (Solo)
----------	----------	4' Clarion (Solo)

Accessories: Swell to Great coupler, Positive to Great coupler, Solo to Great coupler, Fanfare on Great coupler, Great Tremulant, Swell 16', Swell 4', Fanfare on Swell, Positive to Swell, Solo to Swell, Swell Tremulant, Positive 16', Positive 4', Positive Tremulant, Fanfare on Positive, Swell to Positive, Solo to Positive, Zimbelstern, Solo 16, Solo 4, Great to Solo, Swell to Solo, Positive to Solo, Fanfare on Solo, Solo Tremulant, Great to Pedal, Swell to Pedal, Positive to

Pedal, Solo to Pedal, Fanfare on Pedal, Great/Positive Manual Transfer, All Swells to Swell, Zimbelstern, Nightingale.

5. Sacred Heart Cathedral, Rochester, New York.
Paul Fritts and Company Organ Builders, Opus 26, 2008.
Three manuals, 53-stops in [215]

I. Great	*II. Swell*	*III. Oberwerk*	*IV. Pedal*
16'Principal	8' Principal	16' Qvintadeen	16' Principal†
8' Octave	8' Gedackt	8' Principal	16' Subbaß†
8' Salicional	8' Viol di Gamba	8' Gedackt	8' Octave
8' Rohrflöte	8' Voix Celeste	8' Baarpijp	8' Bourdon
8' Traversflöte	4' Octave	4' Octave	4' Octave
4' Octave	4' Rohrflöte	4' Offenflöte	2' Nachthorn
4' Spitzflöte	2 2/3 Nasat	2 2/3 Nasat	Mixture VI-VIII
3' Quinte	2' Gemshorn	2' Octave	32' Posaune†
2' Octave	Terz 1 3/5	2' Blockflöte	16' Posaune
Mixture IV-VI	Mixture IV-VI	Sesquialtera II	8' Trompet
Cornet V	16' Fagott	Mixture V-VIII	4' Trompet
16' Trumpet	8' Trompet	8' Trompet	----------
8' Trumpet	8' Hautbois	8' Vox Humana	----------
8' Baarpfeife	----------	8' Trompeta	----------

Accessories: Swell to Great coupler, Oberwerk to Great coupler, Oberwerk to Positive coupler, Great to Pedal coupler, Swell to Pedal coupler, Oberwerk to Pedal coupler, Variable Tremulants, Wind stabilizer,
(†) Indicates some pipes are transmitted from other stops.

[215] Paul Fritts Organ Builders, "Sacred Heart Cathedral, Rochester, New York," Paul Fritts Organ Builders Website. http://www.frittsorgan.com/opus_pages/galleries/opus_26/specification.html (accessed 1 October 2010).

6. Cathedral of Saint John the Evangelist, Milwaukee, Wisconsin.
Nichols and Simpson, Incorporated, Organbuilders, 2005.
Four manuals and pedal, 23-stops, 30-stops in preparation.[216] These stops are all in addition to the existing Noehren Gallery organ of 1966. Both instruments are playable from a single console.[217]

I. Great	*II. Swell*	*III. Solo*	*IV. Pedal*
16' Violone‡	16' Gedeckt	8' Violone‡	32' Bourdon‡
8' Principal	8' Diapason	8' Violone Céleste‡	16' Principal
8' Bourdon	8' Chimney Flute	8' Harmonic Flute‡	16' Subbass
8' Violone‡	8' Salicional	4' Harmonic Flute‡	16' Violone‡
4' Octave‡	8' Voix Céleste	8' Clarinet‡	16 Gedeckt
4' Nachthorn‡	4' Principal	16' Trombone‡	8' Octave
2' Super Octave	4' Harmonic Flute	8' Tuba‡	8' Bourdon
V Fourniture	2-2/3' Nasard	8' Tromba‡	8' Violone‡
8' Tromba‡	2' Octavin	4' Tromba Clairon	8' Chimney Flute
8' Trumpet	1-3/5' Tierce	----------	4' Super Octave
----------	II Plein Jeu	----------	4' Harmonic Flute‡
----------	III Petit Plein Jeu	----------	32' Ophicleide‡
----------	16' Double Trumpet	----------	16' Trombone‡
----------	8' Trompette	----------	16' Double Trumpet
----------	8' Hautbois	----------	8' Tromba‡
----------	4' Clarion	----------	8' Trumpet
----------	----------	----------	4' Clairon
----------	----------	----------	4' Clarinet‡

[216] Nichols and Simpson Incorporated Organbuilders, "Cathedral of St. John the Evangelist, Milwaukee, Wisconsin," Nichols and Simpson Incorporated Organbuilders Website, http://www.nicholsandsimpson.com/cathedra.htm (accessed 1 October 2010).

[217] The Cathedral of St. John the Evangelist, "Organs of the Cathedral," The Cathedral of St. John the Evangelist Website. http://www.stjohncathedral.org/musicministry/mm-organs.htm (accessed 1 October 2010).

I. Gallery Great	*II. Gallery Swell*	*III. Gallery Choir*	*IV. Gallery Positiv*
16’ Principal	16’ Bourdon	16’ Bourdon	8’ Bourdon
16’ Quintadena	8’ Bourdon	8’ Bourdon	4’ Principal
8’ Principal	8’ Gamba	8’ Gemshorn	4’ Rohrfloete
8’ Rohrfloete	8’ Voix Celeste	8’ Unda Maris	2’ Octave
4’ Octave	4’ Flute Octaviante	8’ Flute Harmonique	VI Scharf
4’ Spitzfloete	2’ Octavin	4’ Flute	II Sesquialtera
2’ Octave	VI Plein Jeu	2-2/3’ Nasard	8’ Cromhorne
2’ Waldfloete	16’ Basson	2’ Piccolo	----------
VI Mixture	8’ Trompette	1-3/5’ Tierce	----------
V Scharf	8’ Hautbois	1-1/3’ Larigot	----------
IV Cornet	8’ Voix Humaine	1’ Flageolet	----------
16’ Bombarde	4’ Clairon	----------	----------
8’ Trompette	----------	----------	----------
4’ Clairon	----------	----------	----------
8’ Chamade	----------	----------	----------
----------	----------	----------	----------
----------	----------	----------	----------
----------	----------	----------	----------

V. Gallery Bombarde	*VI. Galley Pedal*
8 Bourdon	16 Principal
8 Flute Harmonique	16 Subbass
4 Principal	16 Bourdon
2 Octave	8 Octavebass
VI Plein Jeu	8 Gedecktbass
8 Trompette	4 Octave
4 Clairon	2 Octave
8 Chamade	VI Mixture
----------	VI Harmonics
----------	32 Contre-Bombarde
----------	16 Bombarde I
----------	16 Bombarde II
----------	16 Basson
----------	8 Trompette
----------	4 Clairon
----------	8 Chamade

7. Cathedral of Saint Patrick, New York City, New York.
Geo. Kilgen and Son, Saint Louis, Missouri, Opus 5918, 1928-1930.
Gallery Organ: Four-manuals, 157-stops, 114-ranks, electro-pneumatic action.
Chancel Organ: Three-manuals, 46-stops, 23-ranks, electro-pneumatic action.[218]

Gallery Organ:

I. Great	*II. Swell*	*III. Choir*	*IV. Solo*
16’ Diapason	16’ Salicional	16’ Quintaton	16’ Contra Gamba
16’ Bourdon	16’ Bourdon	16’ Contra Viole	8’ Stentorphone
8’ First Diapason	8’ Diapason Phonon	8’ English Diapason	8’ Flauto Major
8’ Second Diapason	8’ Open Diapason	8’ Violin Diapason	8’ Gross Gamba
8’ Horn Diapason	8’ Small Diapason	8’ Doppelflöte	8’ Gamba Celeste
8’ Philomela	8’ Stopped Flute	8’ Tibia Minor	8’ Clarabella
8’ Clarabella	8’ Flute Harmonic	8’ Concert Flute	4’ Flute Ouverte
8’ Gamba	8’ Viol d'Gamba	8’ Flute Celeste	8’ Concerto Viola II
8’ Doppel Flute	8’ Viol d'Orchestre	8’ Viola Horn	4’ Octave
8’ Violoncello	8’ Viol Celeste	8’ Quintadena	4’ Flute Ouverte
8’ Gedeckt	8’ Salicional	8’ Cor de Nuit	4’ Fugara
8’ Viol d’Amour	8’ Voix Celeste	8’ Cor de Nuit Celeste	16’ Tuba Profunda
4’ Diapason	8’ Clarinet Flute	8’ Viole	8’ Tuba Sonora
4’ Principal	4’ Prestant	4’ Flauto Traverso	8’ Tuba Harmonic
4’ Clarabel Flute	4’ Violina	4’ Flûte à Chiminée	8’ English Horn
4’ Flute Harmonic	4’ Salicional	4’ Salicet	8’ Solo Trumpet

[218] New York Chapter American Guild of Organists, “Roman Catholic Cathedral of Saint Patrick, New York City,” New York Chapter American Guild of Organists Website, http://www.nycago.org/Organs/NYC/html/StPatrickCath.html#Kilgen5918 (accessed 7 September 2010).

4’ Violina Sorda	4’ Forest Flute	4’ Violetta	4’ Tuba Clarion
2 2/3’ Nazard	4’ Dolce Flute	Tertian II	----------
2’ Flute Octaviante	2’ Flautino	2’ Super Viola	----------
Ripieno IV	Ripieno V	2’ Piccolo	----------
16’ Posaune	Dolce Cornet III	8’ French Horn	----------
8’ Tromba	16’ Fagotto	8’ Clarinet	----------
4’ Tromba Clarion	8’ Cornopean	8’ Orchestral Oboe	----------
----------	8’ Corno di Bassetto	----------	----------
----------	8’ Oboe	----------	----------
----------	4’ Oboe Clarion	----------	----------
----------	16’ Vox Humana	----------	----------
----------	8’ Vox Humana	----------	----------
----------	4’ Vox Humana	----------	----------

V. Gallery String *VI. Echo Organ* *VII. Echo Pedal* *VIII. Gallery Pedal*

16’ Contra Salicional	16’ Bourdon	16’ Sub Bass	64’ Gravissima
8’ Viol d'Orchestre	8’ Open Diapason	16’ Bourdon	32’ Diapason
8’ Viol Celeste	8’ Violin Diapason	16’ Still Gedeckt	32’ Resultant Bourdon
8’ Salicional	8’ Tibia Major	8’ Bass Flute	16’ Principal
8’ Voix Celeste	8’ Melodia	8’ 'Cello	16’ First Diapason
8’ Violino Sarda	8’ Echo Gamba	8’ Dolce Flute	16’ Second Diapason
8’ Sordo Celeste	8’ Gemshorn	Ripieno V	16’ Violone
4’ Violina	8’ Gemshorn Celeste	16’ Posaune	16’ First Bourdon
4’ Salicet	8’ Echo Flute	----------	16’ Second Bourdon
----------	8’ Vox Angelica	----------	16’ Contra Gamba

----------	8’ Vox Aetheria	----------	16’ Salicional
	4’ Violina	----------	16’ Viola
----------	4’ Flute d'Amour	----------	16’ Dolce Bass
----------	4’ Flauto Amabile	----------	10 2/3’ Quint
----------	2 2/3’ Flute Nazard	----------	8’ Diapason
----------	2’ Flautino	----------	8’ Violone
----------	Echo Ripieno V	----------	8’ Bass Flute
----------	8’ Trumpet	----------	8’ 'Cello
----------	8’ Oboe Horn	----------	4’ Octave
----------	8’ Keraulophon	----------	4’ Flute
----------	8’ Vox Humana	----------	32’ Bombarde
----------	----------	----------	16’ Bombarde
----------	----------	----------	16’ Tuba Profunda
----------	----------	----------	16’ Posaune
----------	----------	----------	16’ Fagotta
----------	----------	----------	8’ Bombarde

Chancel Organ:

I. Great	*II. Swell*	*III. Choir*	*IV. Pedal*
16’ Diapason	16’ Bourdon	16’ Bass Flute	32’ Resultant
8’ First Diapason	8’ Open Diapason	16’ Contra Dulciana	16’ Open Diapason
8’ Second Diapason	8’ Stopped Diapason	8’ Open Diapason	16’ Bourdon
8’ Philomela	8’ Salicional	8’ Violoncello	16’ Lieblich Gedeckt
8’ Viola da Gamba	8’ Voix Celeste	8’ Quintadena	8’ Bass Flute
8’ Melodia	8’ Aeoline	8’ Dulce	8’ Dulce Flute
8’ Dulciana	4’ Flute d'Amour	4’ Flute	8’ Violoncello
4’ Octave	4’ Violina	4’ Fugara	Ripieno

4’ Flute	2’ Flautina	4’ Dulcet	----------
2’ Flute Octaviante	8’ Cornopean	2’ Piccolo	----------
8’ Tuba	8’ Oboe	8’ Orchestral Oboe	----------
4’ Tuba Clarion	8’ Vox Humana	8’ Clarinet	----------
Ripieno V	----------	----------	----------